



## RESEARCH PAPER

### Legal Strategies for Addressing the Environmental Challenges: A Pathway to Sustainable Governance in Pakistan

<sup>1</sup>Shuhab Ud Din Shaikh, <sup>2</sup>Rabel Mangi and <sup>3</sup>Khuram Abro\*

1. Chief Security officer, Security Department; Shaheed Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto University of Law, Karachi, Sindh, Pakistan
2. Lecturer, Department of Family and Social development; Raaza Laiqat Ali Khan Govt. College of Home Economics Karachi, Sindh, Pakistan
3. Lecturer, Department of Law; Shaheed Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto University of Law, Karachi, Sindh, Pakistan

|                       |                           |
|-----------------------|---------------------------|
| *Corresponding Author | khurum.abro@szabul.edu.pk |
|-----------------------|---------------------------|

## ABSTRACT

The article examines the legal systems and sustainable governance practices Pakistan uses to handle environmental crises. The implementation of the Pakistan Environmental Protection Act of 1997 meets financial support requirements but suffers from inadequate institutional capabilities and weak enforcement ability thus diminishing its operational effectiveness. This research examines environmental law effectiveness in present times before proposing governance development strategies. Legal and policy documents serve as the basis for qualitative research conducted by authors who demonstrate that institutional capacity together with public involvement and standard adherence play central roles. The analysis shows emergency regulatory shortcomings that need advanced institutional systems and better public knowledge. The paper points out that environmental problems need customized legal treatment. Environmental sustainability and governance management in Pakistan needs development of three fundamental elements which include accountable systems alongside transparent operational procedures and institutional resilience for enduring administration.

**KEYWORDS** Environmental Governance, Environmental Law, Environmental Challenges, Sustainability, Pakistan

## Introduction

Pakistan Environmental Protection Act of 1997 (PEPA) and the supplemental regulations defines the main framework for environmental protection in Pakistan (Ilyas et al., 2019). The stated legislative provisions fail to achieve their intended goals because of implementation barriers together with inadequate enforcement capabilities and inefficient institutional management (Sohail et al., 2022; Ullah et al., 2021). Environmental degradation in the country worsens because of weak policy enforcement and the country's fast economic growth as well as growing urban areas (Tunio et al., 2025).

The legal frameworks of Pakistan show multiple strengths because the country established the Pakistan Environmental Protection Agency (Pak-EPA) and implemented the National Environmental Quality Standards (NEQS) for pollution control (Rehman et al., 2021). The environmental governance activities have received support from these legislative measures while resources remain limited and agency communication is weak as well as monitoring systems suffer from inadequacies (Murshed et al., 2021). The effectiveness of environmental policies remains restricted because weak decentralization

of fiscal power and governance inefficiencies demand unified financial and environmental governance standards (Muzaffar, t. al., 2023; Malik, et. al., 2023; Ding et al., 2024).

The rigor of policy measures functions as a key factor to develop eco-innovation and green financing processes because they underpin sustainable development (Nabi et al., 2025). The absence of stringent environmental policies in Pakistan has blocked both green financial instrument implementation and the transformation of industrial operations into sustainable operations. National economic policies show insufficient implementation of green finance although international pacts exist and more awareness emerges (Tunio et al., 2024). Research evidence shows that environmental policies experience substantial changes because of exchange rate movements along with changing political stability which makes it difficult to establish stability in economic systems (Ullah et al., 2022).

The analysis of water pollution incidents in the Indus River Basin together with other studies show that legal regulations remain unenforced in reality. Contaminants from industrial operations along with agricultural runoff remain apparent water quality polluters even after law enforcement has been established (Muzaffar & Choudhary, 2017; Fatima et al., 2021; Rana & Bhatti, 2018). The analysis of Pakistan's environmental policies against international nations experiencing matching environmental challenges shows that adopting better institutional capabilities together with stronger punitive measures for rule breakers while adding modern monitoring systems and spreading public environmental knowledge will boost Pakistan's environmental legal strength (Sun et al., 2020; Sohail et al., 2022).

A key literary shortfall exists in the lack of assessment of the current legal framework effectiveness therefore this study examines enforcement challenges and presents suggested improvements (Nadeem et al., 2020). The research assessment of Pakistan's environmental governance remains comprehensive with suggested legal reforms to enhance sustainable environmental management practices nationwide (Ullah et al., 2021; Abid et al., 2021). The study enables policymakers to establish effective decentralization plans that align fiscal efficiency with environmental preservation objectives (Nabi et al., 2025).

The detailed evaluation of Pakistan's environmental protection lawful system contributes to developing genuine insights about environmental governance. Multiple policy solutions undergo assessment in the research about their environmental performance for sustainability initiatives through case-focused analysis. The research comparison of environmental legal strategies in Pakistan against other countries' experiences leads to possible enhancements of legal practices. The research provides official recommendations which suggest Pakistan should establish improved environmental rules and active enforcement systems while boosting community involvement in environmental governance decisions. The investigation pursues answers to the core research inquiry which asks how Pakistan should reform its environmental protection laws to boost sustainability and strengthen policy outcomes and match global standards.

## **Literature Review**

The literature review evaluates the current Pakistani environmental protection laws extensively. The evaluation analyzes positive and negative attributes with unmet requirements in present legal structures. The present section investigates sustainability legal framework performance through case-based analysis. The research considers how

Pakistan compares to other territories that find themselves in similar environmental standings.

### **Legal Strategies and Sustainable Governance**

The primary legislations for environmental protection in Pakistan begin with Pakistan Environmental Protection Act of 1997 (PEPA) and continue with its range of implementing regulations. The academic field recognizes PEPA as the key basis to establish environmental governance parallel with sustainable development (Ilyas et al., 2019). The legal document functions as an essential component that bridges environmental defense with natural resource management systems through sustainability practices which connect to Pakistan's progress in national development. PEPA encountered significant difficulties when trying to fulfill its broad set of goals during implementation execution. Operational weaknesses continue to affect the Act per Sohail et al. (2022) due to unclear execution methods. Law enforcement challenges arise due to imprecise terminology found in legislative language thus making it difficult for authorities to interpret the law to measure its effectiveness. PEPA presents extensive objectives with caring purposes despite lacking extensive practical criteria for monitoring compliance (Ullah et al. 2021; Batool, et. al., 2023).

The core structure of PEPA includes Pakistan Environmental Protection Agency (Pak-EPA) together with Environmental Tribunals that handle both environmental enforcement and judicial matters. The Pakistan Environmental Protection Agency together with Environmental Tribunals face criticism because of insufficient funding and their shortage of expert professionals as well as operational hurdles caused by bureaucracy (Nadeem et al., 2020). The environment regulatory body experiences ineffective performance because of these obstacles that persist. Essential environmental topics in the Pakistan Environmental Protection Act (PEPA) are carefully detailed in its provisions regarding air quality management alongside water quality standards and hazardous waste disposal and project-developed environmental impact assessments (EIAs). The essential environmental provisions experience implementation challenges because institutional barriers interact with stakeholder miscoordination. The environmental legal frameworks of Pakistan need urgent reform because they contain structural problems which institutional growth and upgraded enforcement frameworks and resource distribution procedures will address.

### **Pakistan actively deals with multiple issues in its legal framework and sustainability infrastructure challenges in governance practices.**

Research has revealed essential deficiencies together with beneficial aspects in the environmental protection laws of Pakistan. The regulatory structure works as the framework's primary strength along with the precise environmental targets developed within the structure. Pakistan Environmental Protection Act of 1997 established Pakistan Environmental Protection Agency and Environmental Tribunals as institutional mechanisms according to its framework (Rehman et al., 2021 ; Rong et al. 2025). NEQS position as a crucial strength exists through their exact guidance on pollution regulations for air and water as well as industrial pollution standards. The established environmental standards of Pakistan enabled better pollution management and superior environmental performance (Murshed et al., 2021). Implementation of the legal framework includes National Environmental Quality Standards as a proactive method to manage environmental degradation which demonstrates positive outcomes in controlling degeneration. This framework exhibits two main weaknesses because of its weak enforcement capabilities and operational difficulties. The way law enforcement operates

today has produced major problems where legislation lacks proper execution by enforcement agents. The regulatory bodies fail to meet their effectiveness requirements due to limited resources alongside inefficient institutions along with official corruption (Muzaffar, et. al., 2024; Ikram et al. 2019).

Kluwer Database indicates insufficient legal penalties against non-compliance remain a barrier when trying to prevent non-compliance through present legal systems according to both Chien et al. (2021) and Shahzad et al. (2020). Industrial polluting activities take precedence in the regulatory system despite important pollution sources that emerge from agricultural uses and urban growth. Sun et al. (2020) and Haider et al. (2025) stated that the current standard needs to integrate these strategies for managing environmental breakdown elements and corporate sustainability initiatives. The NEQS and institutional bases show environmental governance structure through institutional arrangements yet several obstacles interfere with their maximum operational strength. The environmental protection capabilities of Pakistan will strengthen when authorities enforce regulations more strictly and increase regulatory participation.

### **Legal Framework and Sustainability**

The established legal system proves effective at controlling water pollution contamination in the Indus River Basin through both industrial facilities and agricultural drainage sites (Fatima et al., 2021; Rana & Bhatti, 2018). Academic research based on environmental case studies allows researchers to see how environmental problems present obstacles while assessing legal responses (Ilyas et al., 2019). Environmental regulation practice demands a dual evaluation approach consisting of regulatory operations and enforcement systems together with their obtained outcomes. The occurrence of deficient law enforcement is common because institutions lack sufficient capacity and agencies demonstrate weak coordination and the departments operate with limited resources (Sohail et al., 2022). The need for effective combined implementation procedures becomes essential because environmental safety regulations lack sufficient coordination between their creation and enforcement stages.

Legal framework evaluation for sustainability gets its significance from measuring the capacity to solve environmental problems. Environmental indicator analysis according to Ullah et al. (2021) and Nadeem et al. (2020) provides an accurate measurement of how effective legal frameworks function. Bodansky and van Asselt (2024) point out that outcome analysis lets researchers assess the effectiveness of pollution reduction measures and biodiversity protection strategies and resource management practices. The assessment of legal approaches to pollution reduction with demonstrated environmental benefits informs future strategic practices according to Abid et al. (2021). Monitoring both enforcement problems and stakeholder participation limitations serves as a vital tool because it identifies institutional improvements that are needed (Rehman et al., 2021).

### **Challenges in Implementation and Legal Reforms**

Environmental laws in Pakistan encounter several obstacles when they try to be enforced across the entire nation. The combination of financial limitations along with insufficient staff and communication issues within institutions and extensive regulatory body corruption represent the main barriers (Murshed et al. 2021; Ikram et al. 2019). Environmental law implementation challenges cause law enforcement agencies to lose their power and create inconsistent results within different regions of Pakistan. The legal framework has undefined elements which make implementation progressively harder.

The regulatory agencies enforce the laws through an uncertain method since legal provisions lack clarity (Chien et al. 2021).

The solution of proper legal reforms alongside improvements will help resolve these barriers. The development of better coordination systems and institutional capabilities represents strategic solutions that government authorities should establish (Sun et al., 2020). The establishment of organizational systems in conjunction with specified environmental agency responsibilities helps diminish administrative roadblocks to enhance leadership quality. When nations adopt international benchmark standards they gain crucial learning possibilities to use for their enhancement initiatives. The incorporation of advanced monitoring systems together with innovative enforcement methods found in successful countries can improve Pakistan's legal system (Fatima et al. 2021; Rana & Bhatti 2018; Tian and Tunio 2023). These practices need local adjustments for Pakistan's specific socio-economic and political conditions to work properly (Sohail et al., 2022). The implementation of sustainable reform requires implementing public participation methods as well as clear regulations for punishment of noncompliance. The enhancement of these elements will increase environmental sustainability accountability which promotes collective sustainability commitments. Systemic reform coupled with the creation of new opportunities will enable Pakistan to enhance its legal framework which will better handle environmental problems and foster sustainable development.

The study fills an important knowledge gap which exists in current academic research about Pakistan's environmental sustainability legal approaches during rising environmental threats. The Pakistani legal framework for environmental protection stands recognized yet studies confirm its limited analysis regarding implementation and enforcement procedures together with evaluation of total impact (Nadeem et al., 2020). The existing framework requires thorough analysis which evaluates its enforcement methods and institutional capabilities and public awareness strategies because these elements have not received sufficient examination. The analysis of environmental law implementation using case studies and international comparisons involving similar environmental issues is insufficient (Ullah et al 2021; Shakoor et al 2024; Ullah et al 2022). This study aims to provide extensive research into the main barriers that prevent effective environmental governance in Pakistan by investigating these gaps. The research proposes concrete legal changes that enhance Pakistan's environmental resistance and promote sustainable development to support academic research and practical policy advancements.

## **Material and Methods**

A qualitative research design serves to examine Pakistan's environmental legal framework together with its implementation processes. The method of qualitative research enables researchers to carry out detailed social investigations which record direct stakeholder feedback along with their reported events and interpretation processes (Mohajan, 2018). The research team uses both interviews and direct observations and analyzes documents for exploring the specific environmental governance practices. The environmental legal framework of Pakistan experiences practical challenges and successful outcomes as well as implementation restrictions which policymakers and legal experts and environmental activists discuss (Ngozwana, 2018). Advantageous observational data demonstrate practical sustainability usage together with legal document analysis that explains sustainability effects stemming from legislative requirements. The research shows flexibility by responding to new themes and results which enables a thorough investigation into environmental governance (Burdine et al., 2021).

Multiple restrictions exist in this research which will impact both the results and analysis of the study. The study depends on secondary data from academic articles and government reports and legal documents which might include biases from the original source material (Pandey & Pandey, 2021). The assessment was limited in scope because the researchers encountered restrictions pertaining to data availability and accessibility. The research scope has been restricted because of time and resource constraints which primarily affected both interview and direct observation approaches (Davidavičienė, 2018). The qualitative research design prevents the study from providing results which can be generalized to conditions outside Pakistan's governmental and environmental framework. Subjective interpretation in qualitative research represents a potential impediment that researchers must address despite their attempts at improving data credibility (Mohajan, 2018). In order to overcome these challenges new investigations should be conducted.

## Results and Discussions

The research paper contains a comprehensive examination of Pakistan's environmental legal frameworks through the presentation and assessment of collected findings. The analysis results serve fundamental purposes in answering the research questions according to the following explanations. The thematic analysis method allows for identification of major themes within the presentation that explore the legal structure as well as positive and negative components and the sustainability implications and legal reform difficulties. The section includes thorough descriptions about discovered outcomes supplemented with essential interpretations of collected data.



Figure 1 Systemic Analysis Chart

## Legal Framework for Environmental Protection in Pakistan

Environmental protection law in Pakistan operates under the Pakistan Environmental Protection Act of 1997 (PEPA). The Pakistan Environmental Protection Act of 1997 (PEPA) and accompanying legislation establish the essential elements which include environmental impact assessment standards and pollution management regulations and Pakistan Environmental Protection Agency (Pak-EPA) regulatory authority (Lazarus, 2023). The National Environmental Quality Standards (NEQS) establish pollution standards which enhance air quality together with water quality (McGregor et al. 2020). Legislative developments have not solved the problems related to environmental law enforcement and implementation.

Despite offering basic environmental protection guidelines the legal structures encounter multiple serious problems which reduce their ability to succeed. Student paper attributes the legislative problems to inconsistent laws which produces multiple interpretation challenges for law enforcement (Bodansky & van Asselt 2024). Environmental law implementation is obstructed by several reducing factors including restricted resources alongside institutional weaknesses and the presence of corruption elements. The legal framework mainly concentrates on industrial pollution while ignoring major pollution sources connected to agriculture and urban development (Khan et al., 2020). The lack of substantial penalties for non-compliance causes the legal provisions to lose their ability to deter non-adherence.

The Pakistani legal infrastructure proves active in protecting the environment but critical assessment points to fundamental implementation difficulties that essential reforms combined with vigorous enforcement practices should remedy (Hancock, 2019). The effective resolution of environmental challenges in Pakistan requires institutions to improve their capabilities and both the penalty system needs improvement and regulation needs an integrated approach.

### **Strengths and Weaknesses of the Current Legal Framework**

The study evaluated the present environmental protection legal system of Pakistan to find both its positive aspects and its areas for improvement. The Pakistan Environmental Protection Act of 1997 (PEPA) stands as a major strength because it establishes extensive laws to deal with environmental matters (Murshed et al., 2021). The government shows its dedication to environmental governance through its creation of the Pakistan Environmental Protection Agency (Pak-EPA) (Light, 2019). The Pak-EPA establishes the National Environmental Quality Standards (NEQS) to enhance environmental quality standards by controlling pollution levels in the air and water.

A number of serious weaknesses appear in the current legal basis which affects its overall effectiveness. Successfully implementing environmental laws remains difficult because Pakistan faces challenges from resource limitations along with institutional incapacity and corruption (Orts 2019). The existing legislation contains various inconsistencies that result in different understandings during implementation and interpretation periods. The existing legal framework shows less interest in regulatory control of pollution from agricultural and urban development activities apart from industrial operations (Lazarus, 2023). Non-compliance to legal provisions faces minimal penalties which weakens the effectiveness of their provisions.

The legal framework shows positive aspects in environmental governance but essential evaluation shows various substantial limitations that block its performance effectiveness. Environmental laws face difficulties during implementation because the inadequate enforcement program stems from insufficient institutional capacity along with

insufficient funding (McGregor et al., 2020). The existence of gaps in parallel with inconsistent language throughout the legislation generates multiple difficulties during both interpretation analyses and enforcement procedures that produce substandard environmental protection results. Environmental regulation must broaden its focus beyond industrial pollution to identify all major environmental degrading sources because industrial pollution alone does not explain environmental degradation (Bodansky & van Asselt, 2024). The elimination of these weaknesses demands extensive reforms that should boost enforcement capabilities and institutional competence and develop an inclusive strong framework to protect the environment in Pakistan.

### **Application of Legal Framework and its Impact on Sustainability**

Research studies the environmental protection framework of Pakistan along with its impact on sustainability targets. The country has established environmental laws based on a legal framework that faces persistent practical barriers for implementation (Khan et al., 2020). The environment suffers due to poor enforcement of legal and regulatory documents because Pakistan faces both resource limitations and bureaucratic inefficiencies together with corruption networks. Multiple environmental areas show no signs of environmental recovery while these worsening conditions produce harmful impacts that impact natural ecosystems and health systems of people along with social development alongside economic development (Hancock, 2019). The current planned monitoring systems prove insufficient for environmental violation detection since they lack effectiveness in enforcing repeated violations.

The research data identifies key operational issues in the application of legal structures so researchers must undertake comprehensive analytical investigations. The deficiency in executing environmental regulations stems from institutional weaknesses which develop from budgetary shortcomings and bribes within the system (Murshed et al., 2021). The official rules and multiple agency responsibilities lead to enforcement challenges that maintain at least two procedural barriers through which entities can avoid compliance with environmental regulations. Environmental success measures are hindered because people know little about environmental protection and the public shows low interest in participating (Light, 2019). Lack of strong precise punishment for environmental violations hinders the ability to stop risky behaviors in the environment. Lawyers need to execute extensive reforms to establish more robust institutions as they foster transparency together with accountability through increased citizen engagement to promote environmental protection (Orts 2019). The implementation of environmental problem-focused structural reform must occur to enable the legal framework to protect Pakistani sustainability and environmental standards.

### **Challenges in Implementation and Opportunities for Legal Reforms**

This study examined the difficulties Pakistan faces when implementing environmental regulations alongside possible solutions from modernizing the legal system. The implementation barriers consist of funding shortages and institutional problems and administrative corruption with complex bureaucratic processes. The numerous implementation barriers block environmental regulations because they persistently contribute to environmental destruction (Hassan et al., 2020). This research produced practical legal improvements. Public environmental management in Pakistan stands to gain success through applying international best practices that incorporate technology-based monitoring systems according to Ikram et al. (2019).



The analysis features a set of legal adjustments while a thorough investigation is required to establish the primary troubles and their resulting consequences from these modifications. The un-enforcement of environmental laws in Pakistan occurs because of poor institutional resources and administrative corruption (Ilyas et al. 2019). The solution to these challenges depends on long-term commitment from official backing that receives constant support from all stakeholder levels. The implementation of fresh environmental legislation serves as the foundation for practical environmental governance although aimed at enhancing ecological management practices. International best practices need to match local environmental factors (Abid et al. 2021). The goal of environmental sustainability in Pakistan demands official forces to collaborate with civil society stakeholders and other representatives through an integrated strategy addressing both implementation barriers and existing legal frameworks.

## **Discussion**

The research goal generates explanations about existing environmental laws in Pakistan and their sustainability consequences. The research examined four essential domains to understand legal structures regarding sustainability development and their implementation impacts to discover possible modification opportunities. The entire environmental protection body of law exists at the national level of Pakistan but difficulties implementing the legislation prevent its effective governance and enforcement. Inadequate institutional power combined with limited resources and ineffective bureaucracy and pervasive corruption problems cause inefficient environment regulations to persist in Pakistan. The environmental decline persists unfiltered because the working systems produce harmed ecosystems which create multiple adverse impacts on human health and national economic development.

The research shows that Pakistan must develop comprehensive reforms across its legal framework to solve its environmental problems. Environmental progress needs three essential reforms consisting of sustainable institutions that maintain integrity and openness while involving the public through environmental education throughout Pakistani society. The combination of innovative management approaches with international environmental standards and corresponding environmental legislation creates excellent prospects for Pakistan to develop its environmental governance system.

The Pakistani legal system requires immediate reform since substantial environmental sustainability measures are necessary for Pakistan. The effective enforcement of environmental regulations together with implemented public programs dedicated to compliance enhancement are necessary for environmental institutions to reduce ecological damage. Public environmental protection policies in Pakistan can be created through combined efforts between government institutions and civil society organizations along with other stakeholders to execute research findings.

## **Conclusion**

Environmental sustainability represents a vital matter for Pakistan since its pollution problems and resource depletion alongside climate change continue to worsen. Environmental regulation in Pakistan operates under the legal framework which mainly consists of the Pakistan Environmental Protection Act of 1997 (PEPA). Environmental policies show limited effectiveness because the existing enforcement systems are weak along with minimal resources and operational inefficiencies in institutions. This research analyzes Pakistan's environmental legal approaches to evaluate their ability in handling

sustainability issues and recommends improvements through legal and institutional reforms.

The results identify positive aspects and major shortcomings inside Pakistan's legal system for environmental protection. The regulatory framework established by PEPA and its affiliated laws needs better enforcement procedures because implementation efforts are ineffective mainly in agricultural regions and urban development sites. Insufficient institutional capacity combined with financial restrictions makes it difficult for Pakistan to execute environmental policies which hinders its ability to fight environmental destruction. Research evidence demonstrates that successful approaches must combine legal structures with education initiatives and partnerships between various sectors.

Kidney biopsies aid the development of better environmental governance frameworks for Pakistan by studying worldwide benchmark implementations and case study analyses. Pakistan's sustainability effort requires (1) better enforcement capacity with (2) public participation support and (3) multiple strategic plans. Pakistan needs to develop one framework that integrates legal systems with social and economic elements and institutional abilities and cultural components to handle environmental disputes. The sustainable environmental governance system of Pakistan will evolve through sectoral reforms allowing diverse sectors to collaborate for sustainability preservation between generations.

### **Recommendation Policy Implication**

Key recommendation is to bolster the enforcement of environmental regulations. This requires enhancing the capacity of the Pakistan Environmental Protection Agency (Pak-EPA) and other regulatory bodies to monitor compliance effectively and enforce penalties. Improved coordination across federal and provincial agencies is also necessary to ensure more consistent enforcement across the country. Multiple strategic policies must be properly implemented to upgrade environmental governance and sustainability throughout Pakistan. As an institution the Pakistan Environmental Protection Agency (Pak-EPA) needs to strengthen its enforcement capabilities through better regulations for environmental violations alongside stricter penalty systems with enhanced agency cooperation. Financial support is essential to strengthen institutional capacity against its necessity of developing staff skills and requires legislative changes to attain transparency goals and confirm employee responsibility for job functions. Forest protection enhances significantly when people receive proper environmental education and actively join environmental stewardship decision programs to help with forestry conservation tasks. The sustainability framework of Pakistan requires the implementation of climate change strategies that will both create renewable energy networks and strengthen climate resilience and disaster readiness plans to become more powerful. Pakistani entities can develop financial collaborations with international partners that provide environmental management best practices and funding resources. Pakistan has built a comprehensive environmental governing system through its policy measures which enhances sustainability development over time.

## References

- Abid, N., Ikram, M., Wu, J., & Ferasso, M. (2021). Towards environmental sustainability: exploring the nexus among ISO 14001, governance indicators and green economy in Pakistan. *Sustainable Production and Consumption*, 27, 653-666.
- Arshad, M.U.; Memon, R.U.R.; Anwar, W.; \*Tunio, F.H.; Silveira Ferreira, P.J. (2024) Nexus Between Intellectual Capital and Sustainable Growth: Moderating Roles of Military-Experienced CEOs and Sustainable Corporate Governance. *Sustainability*, 16, 23, 10533.
- Batool, A., Asmat, K., & Muzaffar, M. (2023). Governance and Transparency: A Case of Pakistan. *Annals of Human and Social Sciences*, 4(3), 846-856.
- Bodansky, D., & van Asselt, H. (2024). *The art and craft of international environmental law*. Oxford University Press.
- Chien, F., Ajaz, T., Andlib, Z., Chau, K. Y., Ahmad, P., & Sharif, A. (2021). The role of technology innovation, renewable energy and globalization in reducing environmental degradation in Pakistan: a step towards a sustainable environment. *Renewable Energy*, 177, 308-317.
- Davidavičienė, V. (2018). Research methodology: An introduction. In *Modernizing the academic teaching and research environment: Methodologies and cases in business research* (pp. 1-23). Cham: Springer International Publishing.
- Fatima, N., Li, Y., Ahmad, M., Jabeen, G., & Li, X. (2021). Factors influencing renewable energy generation development: a way to environmental sustainability. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, 28(37), 51714-51732.
- Government of Pakistan (1997) *Pakistan Environmental Protection Act of 1997 (PEPA)*
- Government of Pakistan (2024) *National Environmental Quality Standards (NEQS)* <https://environment.gov.pk/Detail/MDUzMDI1OGItYWYzZC00NzQ0LTlhZWItZjYzY2RkOTkyZGVh>
- Haider, W.; Tunio, F.H.; Arshad, M.U.; Ferreira, P.J.S. (2025) Nexus Between Corporate Sustainability Reporting and Risk Mitigation: Evidence from Chinese Listed Firms. *Sustainability*, 17, 1622. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su17041622>
- Hancock, J. (2019). *Environmental human rights: Power, ethics and law*. Routledge.
- Hassan, S. T., Khan, S. U. D., Xia, E., & Fatima, H. (2020). Role of institutions in correcting environmental pollution: An empirical investigation. *Sustainable Cities and Society*, 53, 101901.
- Hill, B. (2009). Environmental Justice. *Legal Theory and Practice*, Environmental Law Institute Press, UK.
- Ikram, M., Zhou, P., Shah, S. A. A., & Liu, G. Q. (2019). Do environmental management systems help improve corporate sustainable development? Evidence from manufacturing companies in Pakistan. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 226, 628-641.

- Ilyas, M., Ahmad, W., Khan, H., Yousaf, S., Yasir, M., & Khan, A. (2019). Environmental and health impacts of industrial wastewater effluents in Pakistan: a review. *Reviews on Environmental Health*, 34(2), 171-186.
- Junjie, M., & Yingxin, M. (2022). The Discussions of Positivism and Interpretivism. *Online Submission*, 4(1), 10-14.
- Khan, M. S., Saengon, P., Alganad, A. M. N., Chongcharoen, D., & Farrukh, M. (2020). Consumer green behaviour: An approach towards environmental sustainability. *Sustainable Development*, 28(5), 1168-1180.
- Lazarus, R. J. (2023). *The making of environmental law*. University of Chicago Press.
- Light, S. E. (2019). The law of the corporation as environmental law. *Stan. L. Rev.*, 71, 137.
- Malik, A., Yaseen. Z., & Muzaffar, M. (2023). Governance in Pakistan: A Case Study of Pakistan Muslim League-N, *Journal of Politics and International Studies*, 9(2), 35-49
- McGregor, D., Whitaker, S., & Sritharan, M. (2020). Indigenous environmental justice and sustainability. *Current Opinion in Environmental Sustainability*, 43, 35-40.
- Meyer, J. W., & Rowan, B. (1977). Institutionalized organizations: Formal structure as myth and ceremony. *American Journal of Sociology*, 83(2), 340-363.
- Mishra, S. B., & Alok, S. (2022). *Handbook of research methodology*. Educreation Publishing.
- Mohajan, H. K. (2018). Qualitative research methodology in social sciences and related subjects. *Journal of Economic Development, Environment and People*, 7(1), 23-48.
- Mukherjee, S. P. (2019). *A guide to research methodology: An overview of research problems, tasks and methods*. CRC Press.
- Murshed, M., Rahman, M. A., Alam, M. S., Ahmad, P., & Dagar, V. (2021). The nexus between environmental regulations, economic growth, and environmental sustainability: linking environmental patents to ecological footprint reduction in South Asia. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, 28(36), 49967-49988.
- Muzaffar, M. & Choudhary, S. (2017). Human Development and Democratic Governance: An Analysis, *Orient Research Journal of Social Sciences*, 2(1), 71-94
- Muzaffar, M., Fern, Y. S., & Yaseen, Z (2024). Good Governance and Citizen's Trust in Pakistan: A Moderation Effect of Unethical Behavior, *Asian Journal of Human Services*, 26, 91-108
- Muzaffar, M., Fern, Y. S., & Yaseen, Z. (2023). Governance Dilemma: A Way Forward For Third World States, *Journal of Research Administration* 5(2), 9792-9803
- Nabi, A. A., Ahmed, F., Tunio, F. H., Hafeez, M., & Haluza, D. (2025). Assessing the Impact of Green Environmental Policy Stringency on Eco-Innovation and Green Finance in Pakistan: A Quantile Autoregressive Distributed Lag (QARDL) Analysis for Sustainability. *Sustainability*, 17(3), 1021.
- Nadeem, A. M., Ali, T., Khan, M. T., & Guo, Z. (2020). Relationship between inward FDI and environmental degradation for Pakistan: an exploration of the pollution haven

- hypothesis through ARDL approach. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, 27, 15407-15425.
- Neuendorf, K. A. (2018). Content analysis and thematic analysis. In *Advanced research methods for applied psychology* (pp. 211-223). Routledge.
- Newman, M., & Gough, D. (2020). Systematic reviews in educational research: Methodology, perspectives and application. *Systematic reviews in educational research: Methodology, perspectives and application*, 3-22.
- Ngozwana, N. (2018). Ethical dilemmas in qualitative research methodology: Researcher's reflections. *International Journal of Educational Methodology*, 4(1), 19-28.
- Nizam, H. A., Zaman, K., Khan, K. B., Batool, R., Khurshid, M. A., Shoukry, A. M., ... & Gani, S. (2020). Achieving environmental sustainability through information technology: "Digital Pakistan" initiative for green development. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, 27, 10011-10026.
- Orts, E. W. (2019). Reflexive Environmental Law. *Environmental Law*, 347-460.
- Pandey, P., & Pandey, M. M. (2021). *Research methodology tools and techniques*. Bridge Center.
- Pervin, N., & Mokhtar, M. (2022). The interpretivist research paradigm: A subjective notion of a social context. *International Journal of Academic Research in Progressive Education and Development*, 11(2), 419-428.
- Rana, I. A., & Bhatti, S. S. (2018). Lahore, Pakistan–Urbanisation challenges and opportunities. *Cities*, 72, 348-355.
- Rehman, A., Radulescu, M., Ma, H., Dagar, V., Hussain, I., & Khan, M. K. (2021). The impact of globalization, energy use, and trade on the ecological footprint in Pakistan: does environmental sustainability exist?. *Energies*, 14(17), 5234.
- Rogers, E. M., Singhal, A., & Quinlan, M. M. (2014). Diffusion of innovations. In *An integrated approach to communication theory and research* (pp. 432-448). Routledge.
- Rong, L., Tunio, F. H., Guo, Q., Nabi, A. A., & Talreja, K. (2025). Impacts of financial risk and economic crime on corporate social responsibility in Chinese firms. *Cogent Economics & Finance*, 13(1). <https://doi.org/10.1080/23322039.2025.2485393>
- Ruggiano, N., & Perry, T. E. (2019). Conducting secondary analysis of qualitative data: Should we, can we, and how? *Qualitative Social Work*, 18(1), 81-97.
- Ryan, G. (2018). Introduction to positivism, interpretivism and critical theory. *Nurse Researcher*, 25(4), 41-49.
- Shahzad, M., Qu, Y., Javed, S. A., Zafar, A. U., & Rehman, S. U. (2020). Relation of environmental sustainability to CSR and green innovation: A case of Pakistani manufacturing industry. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 253, 119938.
- Shakoor Chandio, A., Tunio, F. H., & Korai, A. G. (2024). Federalism in South Asia: a constitutional analysis of India and Pakistan. *Cogent Arts & Humanities*, 11(1), 2299536.
- Siedlecki, S. L. (2020). Understanding descriptive research designs and methods. *Clinical Nurse Specialist*, 34(1), 8-12.

- Sileyew, K. J. (2019). *Research design and methodology* (Vol. 7). Cyberspace.
- Sohail, M. T., Majeed, M. T., Shaikh, P. A., & Andlib, Z. (2022). Environmental costs of political instability in Pakistan: policy options for clean energy consumption and environment. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, 1-10.
- Sun, H., Mohsin, M., Alharthi, M., & Abbas, Q. (2020). Measuring environmental sustainability performance of South Asia. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 251, 119519.
- Thompson Burdine, J., Thorne, S., & Sandhu, G. (2021). Interpretive description: A flexible qualitative methodology for medical education research. *Medical Education*, 55(3), 336-343.
- Tian, Y., Tunio, F.H., (2023) Assessing financial risks of foreign agricultural investment in belt and road countries: A risk index approach and VHSD-EM model analysis. *PLoS ONE* 18(12): e0293146
- Tobi, H., & Kampen, J. K. (2018). Research design: the methodology for interdisciplinary research framework. *Quality & Quantity*, 52, 1209-1225.
- Tunio, F. H., Nabi, A. A., Dawood, M., & Shaikh, S. U. D. (2024). Fiscal policy for economic growth and environmental quality: insights from Pakistan's fiscal decentralization. *Discover Sustainability*, 5(1), 211.
- Tunio, F.H.; Nabi, A.A.; Memon, R.U.R.; Fraz, T.R.; Haluza, D. Sustainability in High-Income Countries: Urbanization, Renewables, and Ecological Footprints. *Energies* 2025, 18, 1599
- Ullah, S., Ozturk, I., & Sohail, S. (2021). The asymmetric effects of fiscal and monetary policy instruments on Pakistan's environmental pollution. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, 28, 7450-7461.
- Ullah, Z Tan, X.F, Tunio F.H, Ullah, I. (2022), Impact of CO2 Emissions, Exchange Rate Regimes, and Political Stability on Currency Crises: Evidence from South Asian Countries, *Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business*, 9(2), 29-36
- United Nation Climate Change (2015) United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC); Association for diplomatic Studies and Trainings;
- Vaismoradi, M., & Snelgrove, S. (2019). Theme in qualitative content analysis and thematic analysis, *forum qualitative social research* 20(3), Art. 23.
- Verma, R., Verma, S., & Abhishek, K. (2024). *Research Methodology*. Booksclinic Publishing.
- Yi Ding, Tunio F.H & Nabi A.A. (2024) Harmonizing the Complexities of Financial Development and Fiscal Decentralization in Highly Populated Nations for Monitoring Environmental Quality; *Heliyon*