

Pakistan Languages and Humanities Review www.plhr.org.pk

RESEARCH PAPER

Translation Shifts in relation to Cultural Implications from English to Urdu Translation of Shafak's *Honour*

¹ Snober Zahra, ² Abdul Bari Khan* and ³ Abeera Hassan

- 1. M Phil Scholar, Department of English Language and Literature, Institute of Southern Punjab, Multan, Punjab, Pakistan
- 2. PhD English Applied Linguistics, Faculty of Language & Communication, Universiti Malaysia Sarawak, Malaysia and Senior Lecturer, Institute of Southern Punjab, Multan, Punjab, Pakistan.
- 3. M Phil Scholar, Department of English Language and Literature, Institute of Southern Punjab, Multan, Punjab, Pakistan

*Corresponding Author 17010087@siswa.unimas.my
ABSTRACT

This study digs into the field of translation while specifically focusing on the process of translating cultural implications from English to Urdu in Shafak's novel. Translation is an intricate process that requires mediation between languages and cultures, and inherent to it are various challenges that become most evident when dealing with cultural nuances. Through qualitative analysis of social norms, gender roles, cultural references, portrayal of women, this research uncovers the multifaceted nature of translation shifts. Moreover, reveals the effort required to preserve the essence of source text while adapting to target culture. The exploration of interplay between language and culture, this study contributes to deeper understanding of the complexities inherent in literary translation. The aim of this particular study is to unveil how cultural implications are preserved, adapted, or lost during all of this. Likewise, aims to explore how translation influences the narrative, linguistic, and cultural characteristics of Urdu impact the essence of the original work. By exploring the translational shifts this study sheds light on the multifaceted nature of cultural implications in the realm of literary translations.

KEYWORDS Honour, Social Norms, Gender Roles, Stereotypes, Translation Shifts

Introduction

Translation is simply the substitution of words from one language to another, this process is apparently quite simple; but the underlying complexities render it greater depths and challenges. For this particular reason translation studies have emerged as a separate academic discipline which, "refers to the academic discipline concerned with the study of translation at large, including literary and non-literary translation, various forms of oral interpreting as well as dubbing and subtitling" (Baker & Diriker, 2019, p. 127). Moreover, translation studies as an academic discipline encompasses: entire research and pedagogical activates related with translations, development of theoretical frameworks, case studies to engage in practical matters, criteria for translation training, and translation assessment. Therefore, it would be safe to assume that translation studies are concerned with the translation of both literary and non-literary discourses Baker and Diriker (2019).

As mentioned earlier translation is a complex process, it is not simply the interchanging of words from one language to another rather mediation between the respective cultures, lingual and literary traditions. Likewise, due to the cultural nuances of a language it becomes difficult to translate certain words or phrases which is often the case

with translation involving proverbs. But still, translator attempts to mediate between different languages thus, making an effort to foster inter-intra-cultural communication (House, 2017). While talking about translation it is necessary to convey the respective features from source text otherwise, the target text will not be faithful which is not something a translator strives for.

Translation is a delicate process aimed to capture the essence of literary works; this process becomes more interesting when the cultural realms intervene in the process of translation. The interplay between culture and translation is evident in Shafak's novel *Honour* and its translation by Anwar. As we delve into the translation, we witness not only the interchanging of words from one language to another, but conveyance of the rich tapestry of cultural implications, also unveiling the compelling plot of the novel. This study explores the translational shifts in relevance to the cultural implications.

Translating literary works from one language to another is an intricate process the involves transference of cultural nuances and implications. This study aims to investigate the translational shifts in the Urdu translation of Shafak's novel. Whenever a literary text is translated from one language to another, immense effort is required to preserve the essence and meaning of the text otherwise, the whole effort would be futile. Similarly, the underlying cultural nuances and implications that cause structural and lingual differences to emerge also contribute to make the entire process more challenging. Accordingly, this research aims to understand how cultural implications are preserved, adapted, or lost during all of this. Likewise, aims to explore how translation influences the narrative, linguistic, and cultural characteristics of Urdu impact the essence of the original work. By exploring the translational shifts this study sheds light on the multifaceted nature of cultural implications in the realm of literary translations.

Literature Review

Syahbaniyah and Suhardijanto (2021) explore the transformation of modality adverbs when short stories are translated from Korean to Bahasa; the study aims to identify how original form of the adverb's changes into a different word class when translated in the target language. This research uses the descriptive qualitative method and analyses six Korean short stories and their Indonesian translations. This research identifies that out of the forty-six adverbs of modality only four maintained their original form in the Target Text (TT). Accordingly, ten adverbs of modality underwent a shift and became pronouns, nouns, particles, adjectives, or verbs; whereas, thirty-two adverbs exhibited a combination with other word classes. This study also finds that out of 290 adverb words just 143 were accurately translated, contrastingly, 100 were omitted, and 47 had to undergo a shift in the TT. This study basically highlights the importance of shifting technique to make the TT align with the Korean and Indonesian grammatical systems to make the TT sounds natural and coherent meanwhile preserving to context and message of ST.

Moindjie (2019) explore substitution, as discoursal grammatical cohesion, which is the replacement of an element with substitute serving the same structural purpose; it plays a fundamental role in maintaining coherence and cohesion. This study focuses on two literary texts i.e., *Madame Bovary* by Flaubert and *Strait is the Gate* by Gide to unravel this intricate phenomenon. This study employs frameworks of Halliday and Hasan's cohesion theory (1976) and Catford's theory of translation shifts (1965). The study finds that, English utilises substitutions in the same scenarios where French uses alternative cohesive mechanisms like reference, ellipsis, and repetition. For the achievement of substitution cohesiveness class shifts are employed aligning with the lingual peculiarities inherent in

source and target language. Thus, underscoring the absence of translator from the scene for adherence to lingual norms.

Khan (2019) in *Translation and Culture: A Comparative Analysis of English Idioms and Proverbs with their Urdu Translation* examines what different methods were used during translation of culturally specific phrases from English to Urdu. The study is grounded in theories of equivalence, translation and cultural translation. This study finds, that most of the Urdu translator employ three approaches: looking for a proverb or idiom similar in content and style or a phrase that is similar in content but different in form, or rephrasing using non-idiomatic expressions. In animal connotations, there are three levels of cultural equivalency: complete, intermediate, and non-equivalent. Summing it up, despite linguistic shortcomings and the social element of interpretation, the interpreter's efforts, with a few exceptions, adequately transmitted cultural forms.

Balavatbhai (2020) analyse gender roles, immigration, freedom, and personal transformation, multicultural identity in the context of Shafak's novel *Honour*. In this research the prominence of female writer in Turkey and her exploration of complex societal issues is highlighted. The focus of this study is on the portrayal and depiction of identity, immigrant experience, and elements of native cultures. This research highlights the significance of multiculturalism in the narrative, different aspects of culture, racial, religious, and cultural dimensions.

Zouari (2022) delves into nineteenth and twentieth century feminism unveiling the women's struggle for gender equality and elimination of gendered discrimination. This research addresses a major realisation that feminism has somewhere failed to address all the concerns of women, owing to patriarchy. This paper talks argues that progressive legislations have not been able to fully protect the women from gendered violence due to continued pressure from patriarchy through different institutions, ethics, traditions, and even religion. This study analyses the novel *Honour* from feminist perspective unveiling the intricate connections between patriarchy, religion, and gender violence. Furthermore, it sheds light on an important issue of honour killings, manifestation of gendered violence, prevalent in the Turkish society exploring the shame-pride dynamic. This study offers insights about the interplay of these cultural and ethical factors contributing towards gendered violence in the backdrop of Turkish society and norms.

Golban (2019) establish that contemporary literary and cultural studies are now attentive towards more pressing issues linked with mass migration, global movement, and mass displacement. Even though migration is not novel it has gained momentum due to historical and social factors. The globalized financial systems have given rise to international labour force that inevitably leads towards emergence of illegal immigration. On the other hand, rapid advancements in transportation and communication have also facilitated the movement of people, goods, information, and capital. These transformative categories include individuals with different backgrounds and intentions such as tourists, travellers, pilgrims, refugees, expatriates, immigrants, and exiles. When these individuals' cross border they deal with various cultural, religious, social, ethnic, and linguistic barriers. This study explores these aspects from the perspective of the novel unveiling the clashes, encounters, blending, intermingling of cultures, that reshape and influence the cultural landscapes of countries and cities.

Material and Methods

This study uses qualitative research method, which is commonly employed in translation studies to explore the intricacies of translation. Accordingly, qualitative

research focuses on the non-numerical data and the modes of data collection are usually descriptive such as literary texts, interviews, anthologies so on and so forth (Aspers & Corte, 2019). It is necessary to mention that qualitative research is commonly employed to explore social realities, beliefs, motivations, attitudes, and rationale; it encompasses interviews, observations, focus groups, literary text (Aspers & Corte, 2019, p. 142). During literary translations involving English to Urdu or any other languages wide range of strategies are employed by the translators to convey the cultural nuances and intended meaning of Source Text (ST). Understanding these strategies, their implications, linguistic, cultural adaptations, context preservation in TT can be done through the usage of qualitative research method. As far as sampling is concerned, two books are going to be the primary sources i.e., Shafak's novel *Honour* and its subsequent translation into Urdu by Anwar. For this research sample dialogues have been picked from the works of both authors to analyse their translation, highlighting the pivotal moments and interactions. Dialogues of any specific character have not been picked rather they have been selected to best explain the ideas.

Moreover, for data analysis this study will follow Braun and Clarke (2021) content analysis method; because of its effectiveness in systematically examining textual data, likewise, it is also suitable for scrutinizing the translated dialogues and identifying patterns and themes. This research employs Vinay and Darbelnet's theory of translation shifts postulated in their seminal work Comparative Stylistics of French and English: A methodology for translation (1958). This research aims to explore translational shifts and cultural implication in the context of the novel. Vinay and Darbelnet have identified various techniques of translation such as: Direct translation, and Oblique translation the latter is further broken-down as, borrowing, calque, literal translation, transposition, modulation, equivalence, and adaptation; each technique varies from the other characteristically and in execution.

Theoretical Framework

This particular study is rooted in the works of French scholars Vinay and Darbelnet who propounded the notion of translation shifts in their seminal work Comparative Stylistics of French and English: A methodology for translation (1958). Wherein they have suggested that differences in languages lead towards incorrect translations due to different shifts therein, two main categories of translations have been identified; direct translation and oblique translation, the latter has been further categorised unlike the former. These subcategories of oblique translation are: literal translation, transposition, modulation, equivalence, and adaptation (Vinay & Darbelnet, 1958, p. 23).

Data Analysis

Social Norms and Gender Roles

ST

We came to warn you that you're about to commit sacrilege (Shafak, 2012, p. 12).

TT

It is apparent from this example that the Turkish society is rooted in Islam and its theological principles resultantly, the same norms are portrayed to be prevailing in the narrative. Naze being told that is going to commit a sacrilege unveils how the society and those surrounding her believed in the teachings of religion therefore, they had an idea of what sacrilege was. Structural shifting is evident in this example, the source text sentence is simple declarative whereas, in Urdu it is more complex with multiple clauses. Word order shift is also apparent the subject, 'we' in the beginning of ST but in TT it is later in the sentence. The translation of 'sacrilege' as 'توبين مذہب' reflects modulation to preserve cultural and religious notion in the target text to suit their lingual and cultural sensibilities.

ST

Dervishes, eccentrics and lovers aside, for the rest of the people nothing was astonishing, and everything was as it should be (Shafak, 2012, p. 5)

TT

The reference from the source text sheds light on the prevailing culture of Sufism and mysticism wherein, dervishes and eccentrics are quite normal. Since the narrative is depicting the culture of Turkey and of its people therefore, something rooted in their shared religious culture is obviously a representation of the norms the society believes in. These values have been translated and conveyed accurately in the target text. Word class shift is visible, in source text the words, *dervish*, *eccentrics*, *and lovers* are nouns whereas, in target text they are represented as descriptive phrases and adjectives. Moreover, the word, 'astonishing' has undergone modulation in the target text, as it aligns more with the linguistic and cultural norms of target language this way. Equivalence shifts has also been employed by the translator, visible through the translation of the phrase, 'as it should be.'

ST

'How can you expect Allah the Almighty to reveal His ways to you when He is known to have spoken only to prophets?' remarked the second man, who had but a few teeth left in his mouth. 'Surely there was no woman among them.' (Shafak, 2012, p. 5)

TT

This instance points out the inferior treatment of women in Turkish society as mandated by the patriarchal norms. Naze is criticized for not saying anything because she intends to find our god's plans for them. Nonetheless, Naze is told that it is not right to expect knowing all this rather it is not even possible because of her gender, and the fact that women were never prophets. Thus, the subjugated and derogated status allotted to women is apparent here. This translation involves word order shift, the differences between the syntax of Urdu and English contribute to that leading towards word order differences. The word, 'Almighty' has undergone modulation as it has been translated as, 'عالى a term used to refer to Allah's greatness and majesty. Equivalence shift has also been used the phrase "only to prophets" in the source text is translated as "بى صرف اپنے پیغامبروں سے "in the target text.

Cultural References

ST

Don't worry, there's always a way to appease a djinni (Shafak, 2012, p. 19)

TT

The word, 'djinni' has been substituted with the most suitable equivalent thus, making it evident certain changes have been made to the sentence structure of the target text nonetheless, best effort has been put to transfer the cultural references from the ST to the TT. In this translation equivalence shift is apparent as the word, 'appease' has been translated as, 'خوش کرنے' to convey the same general meaning serving the same purpose as the source word. The phrase, 'there's always a way' has been translated as, 'طریقہ ہوتا ہے' which is modulation.

ST

You must have been jinxed (Shafak, 2012, p. 19)

TT

The word 'jinxed' has not been replaced with its direct equivalent rather with an equivalent that conveys the idea but not exactly as it is. It is important to mention that the connotation 'jinxed' has in English cannot be reproduced in Urdu; thus, to mediate through these differences the translator has used sense-for-sense translation to preserve the meaning. The translation has employed, equivalence shift to translate, 'jinxed' as, ' نحوست 'to convey the intended meaning and purpose; moreover, the phrase 'you must have been' has been modulated into "نم ضرور" in the target text. The word order in the target text follows the source text's word order for the most part but there are some variations to ensure the translation is grammatically correct in Urdu.

ST

In a few hours I'll take the sesame *halva* off the hob (Shafak, 2012, p. 1)

TT

Stereotypical Portrayal of Women

ST

He had given them two more daughters when they already had six, and still not a single son (Shafak, 2012, p. 4)

TT

The stereotypical portrayal of women is quite evident here; the narrative is questioning why God has blessed the couple with another daughter despite already having six and not even a single song. It is often associated with Turkish culture that they prefer giving birth to boys instead of girl because apparently, they are a burden. The same idea is being communicated in the target text as borrowed from the source text's narrative. The phrase "two more daughters" in the source text is translated as "مزيد دو بيڻيال" which is an equivalence shift. Additionally, the phrase "He had given" is modulated into "ان كو مزيد" which is a shift in meaning.

ST

Thus, Naze pursed her lips like a folded hem, determined not to say a word (Shafak, 2012, p. 4)

TT

This extract also unveils the submissive role assumed by women, how to Turkish society ordains them to be. Herein, Naze the central character is bound not to say a word on giving birth to another daughter, probably because Naze is also lost of words, until god will reveal why he did so. Shafak makes it evident how burdening it is to give birth to daughters instead of boys in the Turkish society and the mother undeniably suffers from that burden. The phrase "like a folded hem" is translated as "تَم شَده سنجاف كي طرح" which is an equivalence shift, where the translator chooses a phrase in the target language that conveys the same general meaning as "like a folded hem" in the source text. There is also modulation as the phrase "determined not to say a word" is translated into "اعزم كي ساته وه ايك لفظ بهي نہ كي گي۔ اس بارے ميں پُر "in the target text. This is a shift in meaning where the concept is expressed differently in Urdu.

ST

Thus saying, he announced that he had alternatives in mind: Pembe and Jamila – Pink and Beautiful. Names like sugar cubes that melted in your tea, sweet and yielding, with no sharp (Shafak, 2012, p. 7)

TT

The stereotypical portrayal of women is apparent in the source text; in this example specific metaphors have been used for them that are related to sweetness, also indicating lack of sharpness. The metaphors, 'sweet and yielding' and 'with no sharp edges' point out towards certain qualities that should be innate in women, as per the stereotypical norms dictating the society. Notably, these qualities are implicitly indicating submissive and subjugated role of women; the translation carries these stereotypical gendered images reinforced through words. Translator has employed translation shifts to convey the same gendered imagery while adhering to the target language; the translation therefore, does not challenge or subvert the stereotypical portrayal of women.

Findings

The findings of this study reveal that: Shafak's has depicted the social norms and gender roles prevalent in the Turkish society through her compelling narrative; these values have been translated and similarly conveyed in the TT. However, at certain instances the translator did not struggle to find the suitable equivalents because those conceptions existed in the culture of target language and not only source language. Moreover, the translator has effectively communicated the cultural implications pertaining to gender dynamics, religious norms, and societal expectations, reflective of the patriarchal nature of the Turkish context. Furthermore, the study also finds that the cultural references demonstrated in the ST have been preserved in the TT, thereby, the target audience, Urduspeaking readers, could grasp and resonate with the intended cultural nuances. The translator has adapted and transferred cultural references, proverbs and idiomatic expressions, to maintain the essence of the ST. The research highlights the stereotypical portrayal of women in both the source and target texts; emphasizing the subjugation of women and their inferior status in Turkish society.

Discussion

In this section the findings of this particular research will be compared and contrasted with that of other researches. Accordingly, the notion of culture and intercultural competence arising are much more complex phenomena as they are perceived to be by many translators. It is important and necessary for translator to be aware of the cultural complexities and differences; the more they are aware of them easier it is for them to transcend or navigate them. However, it has never been the case when translators translated texts without being aware of the cultural differences and their significance to the entire process Mizani and Sience (2009). The interplay of culture, cultural differences in translation theory has been substantial; similarly, cultural knowledge and cultural differences are emphasized in translator training and translation theory. Furthermore, there are certain words and phrases that are heavily grounded in one culture that translating them in another language is not possible. This very point has puzzled translators as they debate over to paraphrase or use nearest equivalent, or to use a new word, or to transcribe. These phrases and words that are cultural bound deemed to be 'untranslatable' continue to fascinate translators and theorists (Mizani & Sience, 2009).

Balavatbhai (2020) have analysed gender roles, immigration, freedom, and personal transformation, multicultural identity in the context of Shafak's novel *Honour*. They focus on the portrayal and depiction of identity, immigrant experience, and elements of native cultures. This research highlights the significance of multiculturalism in the narrative, different aspects of culture, racial, religious, and cultural dimensions (Balavatbhai and Hirenkumar, 2020). This particular research has also found the stereotypical portrayal of women in both the source and target texts; emphasizing the subjugation of women and their inferior status in Turkish society.

Similarly, Ariech (2019) explore the notion of manhood and other societal and cultural aspects in the context of Shafak's novel. This research focuses especially on the emotional and physiological abuse, masculine insecurity, influence of cultural norms on gender roles, and discrimination of women. This study is grounded in the theoretical frameworks of psychoanalysis and feminist theory exploring the various societal, geopolitical, psychological factors as narrated and depicted in fictional accounts. The aim of this study is to highlight the patriarchal societal setup; this study ultimately, links the masculinity in Turkish culture, with women's suffrage in the society.

Conclusion

This research has illustrated the multifaceted nature of translation revealing the intricate relationship it shares with cultural implications. This research analyses the social norms, gender roles, cultural references, and the portrayal of women in both source and target texts to shed light on the complexities faced by translators as they endeavour to bridge linguistic and cultural gaps. This research is not limited to the provision of insights pertaining to the strategies of translation and the inherent challenges; also highlights the importance of maintaining the essence of ST while making cultural adaptations to suit the target audience. It has broader implications contributing towards the understanding of cross-cultural communication and the convergence of cultural values in the realm of literary translation.

Recommendations

The future recommendations are as follows;

- Expanding the scope of study is a viable option in future more aspects of translation shifts, and cultural implications can be explored to render a deeper and richer understanding of the translation process. The examination of various passages and dialogues from the ST and the TT can reveal trends and patterns providing valuable insights about the entire process.
- Collaboration with experts from cultural and literary aspects of both the source and target languages can provide valuable insights validating the accuracy of cultural implications in the TT. These experts can assess the alignment of the translation with cultural norms, values, and contexts.
- Conducting interviews and surveys with the translators involved in the translation
 of Shafak's *Honour* can provide insights about translation strategies they used and
 also about the kind of challenges they faced. Moreover, knowing their decisionmaking processes can be quite helpful as it can enlighten the translation studies
 students and researchers. This can provide deeper insights into the choices made
 during the translation process.
- The scope of the study can be broadened by conducting similar studies on translations of other works by Shafak or by different authors to establish a broader framework for understanding translation shifts and cultural implications in Urdu translations of Turkish literature.

References

- Aspers, & Corte. (2019). What is Qualitative in Qualitative Research. *Qualitative Sociology*, 42(2), 139–160
- Ariech, F. A. Z. (2019). *Subversive Masculinity in Elif Shafak's "Honour"*. Unpublisheed thesis submitted for Master's degree in Literature and Civilization.
- Baker, M., & Diriker, E. (2019). Conference and simultaneous interpreting. *In Routledge encyclopedia of translation studies* (pp. 95-101). Routledge.
- Balavatbhai, V. H. (2020). Multicultural Identity in Elif Shafak's Honour. *International Journal of Recent Research Aspects*, 7(4), pp. 9-12.
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2021). Can I use TA? Should I use TA? Should I not use TA? Comparing reflexive thematic analysis and other pattern-based qualitative analytic approaches. *Counselling and psychotherapy research*, 21(1), 37-47.
- Catford, J. C. (1965). A Linguistic Theory of Translation; an Essay in Applied Linguistics: Oxford UP.
- Golban, T. (2019). The Migrant Hero's Boundaries of Masculine Honour Code in Elif Shafak's Honour. In Culture, Literature and Migration. *Transnational Press London*, 103-118.
- Halliday, M. A. K. and Hasan, R. (1976). Cohesion in English. London: Longman.
- House, J. (2014). Translation quality assessment: Past and present. In *Translation: A multidisciplinary approach* (pp. 241-264). London: Palgrave Macmillan UK.
- Khan, L. A. (2019). Translation and culture: a comparative analysis of English idioms and proverbs with their Urdu translation. *Pakistan Journal of Language and Translation Studies*, 1(58-83).
- Moindjie, M. A. (2019). The Cohesiveness of Personal Reference in Translation: A Case Study of French and English. *International Journal of Applied Linguistics and English Literature*, 8(4), 130-136.
- Mizani, S., & Sience, F. (2009). Cultural translation. *Personal Journal of Philosophy of Language and Education*. 1(1). 49-60.
- Syahbaniyah, N. R., & Suhardijanto, T. (2021). Translation of Korean-Indonesian short stories: An analysis of class and semantic shifts of adverbs of modality. *LINGUA*, 16(2). 45-54.
- Vinay, J.-P., & Darbelnet, J. (1958). Comparative stylistics of French and English: *A methodology for translation*. John Benjamins Publishing.
- Zouari, L. (2022). Male Pride/Female Shame: Gender Violence in Elif Shafak honour. *Journal of Humanities Insights*, 6(01), 37-41.