P-ISSN 2708-6453	Pakistan Languages and Humanities Review	Jan -Mar 2023, Vol. 7, No. 1
O-ISSN 2708-6461	http://doi.org/10.47205/plhr.2023(7-I)50	[573-580]

Pakistan Languages and Humanities Review
www.plhr.org.pk

RESEARCH PAPER

Red Women's Out-of-Placeness in Glancy's Reason for Crows

Farrukh Munawar[1] Dr. Qasim Shafiq*[2]

1. M. Phil Scholar, Department of English Language and Literature, The University of Faisalabad, Punjab, Pakistan
2. Associate Professor, Department of English Language and Literature, The University of Faisalabad, Punjab, Pakistan

***Corresponding Author** saknshs@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Geographers emphasize that spatiality should not be rooted in objective space but in human-made space, which includes place and locale, and the analysis of spatiality is closely intertwined with social analysis and vice versa. With Tim Cresswell's theorization of transgression and out-of-placelness, this study delimits Diane Glancy's Reason for Crows to explore red women's spatiality and how they get placement in American spatial boundaries. Glancy employs sensory experiences within Indigenous American space as a tangible technique to combat the feeling of displacement. These audiovisual and neurological experiences assist Glancy'sindigeneity in locating red women within Indigenous American textual space. This analysis of red women's social space in Indigenous American normative geographies nuances the Indigenous American class, ethnicity and gender, which are embedded in places, regions and landscapes. This study concludes how Indigenous American normative geographies, women's writings and socio-spatial paradigms are controlled by American patriarchal norms. To challenge red women's spatial marginalization and discrimination in the Euro-American text/ context, the red women do not conform to the patriarchal and Eurocentric norms of America. They disrupt the American patriarchal orientation and strive to connect with transgression and develop a sense of placement concerning various Indigenous American landscapes.

KEYWORDS Indigenous American Patriarchy, Normative Geographies, Red Woman, Socio-Spatial Paradigms, Transgression

Introduction

To explore the concepts of space and place, this study employs Tim Cresswell's paradigms of transgression and in-placeless, and hence, centers on the intersection of social and geographic realms in Indigenous American women's writings. Its objective is to elucidate the indigenous geographies and the active participation of women within them and to argue the issues of identity, gender, and economic aspects, which contribute to the understanding of women's spatial experiences. In Diane Glancy's*Reason for Crows*, this study observes a dynamic role of multifaceted culture that lurks inside the process of spatiality to highlight the positioning and engagement of Indigenous American women concerning the intricate patriarchal politics of space and place.

This study underscores the significance of knowledge of Indigenous American sacred spaces and places, emphasizing that the experience of space and place is personal and arbitrary, and varies among individuals or groups. Concerning this, Indigenous American female geographers scrutinize the foundational structures of male authority and their connections to the Indigenous normative marginalization. In this context,

Indigenous American female geographers highlight women's emancipation by acknowledging the spatial aspects of women's oppression, dynamics, and origins within their native locales and also by documenting strategies of resistance. This research draws the nuances between these spatial aspects concerning humanistic approaches and feminist geography, shedding light on the social imbalances faced by Indigenous American women. Through this exploration, this study aims to contribute to an understanding of the complex interplay between space, place, and the experiences of Indigenous American women within these socio-geographic dynamics.

Literature Review

The term 'geosophy,' introduced by Wright (1947), encapsulates the idea of geographical knowledge and the human capacity to make sense of randomness. This concept underscores that the recording of geographical data and the subsequent reactions to geographical stimuli are inherently intertwined. Monk and Hanson's essay on "Geography and Gender" published in 1982, is regarded as a groundbreaking text that introduces the concept of feminine geography. Their work sheds light on the specific experiences of women, both within their native places and beyond. They point out the gender-blind bias in geographic research, emphasizing that women have often been rendered invisible in such studies. Doreen Massey's (2004) "Space, Place and Gender (1994)" delves into feminist economic geography, offering valuable insights into this field. Yi-Fu Tuan (1998) asserts the existence of hierarchical structures in different cultures, each with its distinct hierarchal senses. He further delves into the notion of sensuous sensitivity and its contributions to spatial experiences, emphasizing the importance of sensory perceptions in understanding place and space (Tuan, 1997). This recognition challenges the universality of sensory experiences and underscores the cultural specificity of our perceptual hierarchies.

Paul Rodaway (2005) argues that Diane Glancy often overlooked sensory cues to imbue her characters with a palpable sense of location. He highlights the interrelationship between senses and geographical experiences and contributes to the conceptualization of sensuous geography and its role in (re)mapping spaces (Rodaway, 2005). Concerning spatial theory, Pamela Moss and Isabel Dyck's (1999) theoretical assumptions concerning physical disability and spatial marginalization stand out. Doreen Massey (1995) emphasizes the role of place in shaping social and economic processes across space. Massey's perspective sees places as dynamic entities produced through constant flows within them. Sack (1993) introduces three ways in which place and space exert fundamental influences on human existence: in or out-of-place spatial interactions, and the interplay between surface and depth. According to him recent developments in human geography are often referred to as the mobility turn, centered on the movement of individuals, goods, and ideas.

Material and Methods

Tim Cresswell, Professor of Human Geography at the University of London, in his book *Place: A Short Introduction* (2004) makes contributions to the understanding of the politics of place and space. Cresswell's conceptual framework, developed in his earlier work in 1996, is rooted in the ideas of transgression, out-of-place activities, and normative geography. These three fundamental elements form the basis for conceptualizing the geographical dimension of place and its social context. Cresswell employs the concepts of space and place to create what he terms "normative geography," a socio-cultural paradigm (Cresswell, 2004, p. 9). Normative geography serves as the cornerstone upon which the concepts of transgression and out-of-place behavior are

constructed. Cresswell (2004) establishes the notion of normative geography based on the "sense of appropriateness" (p. 3). This sense of appropriateness is shaped by the expectations of behavior within a specific environment, influenced by both the physical location and social context (Cresswell, 2004). The concept of normative geography hinges on people's social assumptions and their perception of what is appropriate in a particular region. Consequently, normative geography constitutes a realm where the appropriateness and inappropriateness of specific activities are determined by established norms and patterns. What is considered proper behavior in one area may be deemed inappropriate in another, as it does not align with the expected conduct of that specific place.

Cresswell argues that individuals with social dominance within a given social group hold the authority to define whether certain behaviors are deemed proper or not (Cresswell, 2004). Through this process, socially privileged groups establish a set of guidelines that delineate what constitutes appropriate behavior within a particular geographical area. It is crucial to underscore that the classification of suitable behavior concerning a place is not inherently determined by the natural characteristics of the location. Instead, it is shaped by the personal agendas and values of those who establish these norms, defining what is considered right and wrong behavior within that space.

Textual Analysis

Textual analysis of Diane Glancy's*Reason for Crows* (2009), within the theoretical context developed by normative geographer Tim Creswell concerning "out of placeness" and the transgressions of indigenous women argues that Indigenous American female geographers aim to underscore the prioritization of Indigenous American and American males and their role in marginalizing the lives of women concerning Indigenous American places. This has led to the establishment of fully-fledged sub-disciplinary and interdisciplinary endeavors that take into account the nuances of gender, place, and culture. This study about red women's marginalization extends to its broader influence on the spatial patterns experienced by red women at different scales and levels.

Glancy portrays the physical and geographic journey of Kateri, a child born to a Mohawk father and an Algonquin mother in the village of Ossernon, situated on the south bank of the Mohawk River. Kateri's life takes a pivotal turn when a smallpox outbreak claims the lives of her parents and young brother when she is just five years old. Her uncle, Chief Iowerano, takes her under his wing. While Kateri manages to survive the epidemic, it leaves her with facial "pits" and "poor" eyesight (Glancy, 2009, p. 3). As a result of these physical characteristics, boys avert their gaze, and children snicker as she passes by. While Kateri grapples with her impaired vision, it is her facial disfigurement that proves to be the most challenging to conceal. Kateri is aware of her facial disfigurement, and this self-awareness occasionally plunges her into profound isolation from her hometown and her own people. Even though she occasionally uses a blanket to shield her eyes from the sun, she primarily deploys it to conceal her "poked face" (Glancy, 2009, p. 7). When an individual grapples with a chronic illness, they often grapple with feelings of "uncertainty" and "variability" (Moss &Dyck, 2012, p. 233). They begin to ask questions whether their body will continue to function as it once did or if it will become abnormal. Over time, they come to realize that their body is, indeed, different. This realization is not solely driven by their own struggle to carry out everyday tasks but is also shaped by the reluctance of others to accommodate their needs.

Kateri's most profound visual impairment manifests when she gazes into the woods, where the shapes of the trees appear "twisted," and she sees nonexistent snowflakes (Glancy, 2009, p. 4). The individuals who avert their faces and the children who "laugh" at her consistently serve as constant reminders of her challenging circumstances. Faced with these unrelenting challenges, she embarks on a quest for a "sanctuary" at an early age (Glancy, 2009, p. 3). Kateri's relentless pursuit of refuge and her growing self-awareness concerning her limited physical abilities play a pivotal role in her personal development. Her journey towards understanding herself is intricately woven with her battle against the limitations imposed by her disability and the societal attitudes she encounters.

A destabilized material body "invariably disrupts the daily lives of women" (Moss &Dyck, 2012, p. 233). Kateri's disability exerts a profound impact on her daily activities and social interactions. She assists her uncle's wife in tasks like gathering corn, carrying small bundles of wood from the forest, transporting water in a small bucket, and pounding grains, "she is unable to perform the responsibilities typically assigned to girls and women" (Glancy, 2009, p. 6). Tasks such as cooking, sewing, scrubbing floors, tending to household chores, and engaging in recreational activities are all beyond Kateri's capabilities. Even her beadwork, although she perseveres, presents immense challenges due to her blindness. She must feel her way through the process with a bone needle and sinew (Glancy, 2009). Kateri's sense of being out of place is exacerbated by her impaired body, as Glancy challenges the notion that Indigenous American society is based on the ideals of a "working body" and an "able body" (Moss &Dyck, 1999). Her condition, compounded by the effects of smallpox, disrupts the flow of daily social life and marks a transition into a new realm of experiences. In an attempt to conceal her pocked face from others after contracting smallpox, Kateri resorts to covering her face with a blanket (Glancy, 2009). Her use of the blanket as a form of facial concealment underscores the social marginalization that accompanies her condition.

Despite being the daughter of a Mohawk chief, Kateri's condition prevents her from holding a prominent position in the social hierarchy. Not only does she find herself in a state of social isolation, but she also relies on her sister for protection when their village comes under attack. Kateri constantly grapples with the redefinition of her identity as a body within her community, a process that becomes a "site of struggle" (Glancy, 2009). Her recovery from sickness, as depicted by Glancy (2009), leaves her feeling "weird" among her own people (p. 60). Kateri's journey highlights the complex interplay between disability, identity, and societal norms, as she navigates the challenges of her unique position in the community.

Much like Kateri's profound sense of alienation caused by her illness, she is also beset by emotional traumas that stem from it. This sensation of displacement in a place that was once her true home is further exacerbated by her estrangement. Both of Kateri's battlefronts, her own body, and her village, are simultaneously active, resulting in her marginalization and exclusion in both domains. Additionally, she must grapple with her socio-spatial marginalization as a consequence of her disability, necessitating her to challenge the characterization of her body as a disabled entity. Put simply, her identity as a disabled individual comprises two interconnected sites of struggle: her bodily space and the social space within the narrative.

Women who are afflicted by disabilities and illnesses "engage [themselves] in distinct material practices" as a means of negotiating the "ambiguity, indeterminacy, and unpredictability" of their conditions (Moss &Dyck, 1999). The objective of these material practices is to reposition the site of struggle, ultimately redefining their place within

society. However, it remains uncertain how Kateri will combat this marginalization, exclusion, and the reconfiguration of her battlefronts to carve out a space for herself. This analysis will explore how Kateri confronts her feelings of alienation in a Native American environment in the subsequent section of this chapter. Kateri, whose true name is Tekakwitha, possesses a name with multiple meanings, all intrinsically tied to the act of seeing (Glancy, 2009). Tragically, her ability to see has been severely compromised due to her early battle with smallpox, rendering her with limited vision. She frequently stumbles as she navigates her town and struggles to discern objects on the ground before they blur into obscurity. Her impaired vision leaves her without a sense of rootedness in her surroundings (Glancy, 2009). Human space relies heavily on sight, and her nearsightedness inhibits her ability to perceive and comprehend the landscape in which she resides (Tuan, 1997).

The phenomenon of visual geography pertains to "the unique contribution of the visual reception system to the sense of geography, particularly our location, orientations, and the characteristics of places" (Rodaway, 1994, p. 115). The term "optic geography" could be used to underscore the significant role of the eyes in this context (Rodaway, 1994, p. 115). However, such nomenclature might not fully encompass the breadth of this phenomenon. Consequently, a more inclusive term like "visual geography" is proposed, as it enables us to explore not only the "geographic experience" directly shaped by the act of seeing with the eyes but also the visual tools, such as maps, and metaphors like "landscape," that someone regularly employs to navigate and understand our environment (Rodaway, 1994, p. 115). Kateri's journey, marked by her impaired vision, adds a unique layer to her experience of space and place within the Native American context. It becomes a significant facet of her identity and a central theme in the narrative, one that she must confront and transcend in her quest for self-discovery and a sense of belonging.

Kateri's perspective is marked by an inability to distinguish the shapes of trees, the appearance of the priests she encounters, and a profound lack of visual perception that is essential for appreciating the distinct features of her home and the surrounding forests (Glancy, 2009). Her impaired vision robs her of the opportunity to witness the world's creation, understand its unique characteristics and processes, and grasp how it all comes together. "[V]isualizing" these spatial markers serve as the foundation for the conceptualization of areas and locations (Rodaway, 1994, p. 116). It encompasses the use and production of maps and satellite images, the investigation of behavioral patterns and the processes driving physical change, as well as the communication of complex relationships through diagrams and other visual displays. Vision is a crucial component of the geographic experience. "[S]ight provides us with a synthetic view of the environment as a whole, as a view or scene and aids in the ability to differentiate objects based on their color, texture, shape, relative size, and position in space" (Rodaway, 1994, p. 117). However, to Kateri, all these objects appear as "dark spots," rendering her unable to distinguish between people, trees, and the ground in her surroundings (Glancy, 2009, p. 14). Her vision is insufficient to discern "the specifics of the leaves but the overall manifestation of yellow leaves right before winter" (Glancy, 2009, p. 18). When she enters the church, she struggles to judge the space's forms, size, and configurations, often tripping over benches due to her impaired vision (Glancy, 2009). Kateri's poor eyesight limits her capacity to perceive the "richness of detail, range, and diversity of visual information" (Rodaway, 1994, p. 117). Eyesight "mediates person-environment interactions" (Rodaway, 1994, p. 118), meaning our ability to establish a coherent connection with our immediate environment is contingent on our sense of sight. Without a true sense of sight, a person cannot relate to their surroundings. Kateri's poor

eyesight prevents her from forming a strong connection with her home, and she rarely ventures outside of her longhouse, as her blindness makes her vulnerable to harm (Glancy, 2009).

The synthesis of sight and brain activity is what makes vision "abstract and synthetic" (Rodaway, 1994, p. 118). In essence, the physiological eye and brain must work in tandem to produce a view. Without this coordination between the two organs, it would be challenging, if not impossible, to construct any image or scene. Kateri's physiological eye receives no information from her surroundings, making it exceedingly difficult for her to construct a mental picture or map of the area. Her impaired vision hinders her from being able to "orient" herself in her local surroundings. She can only perceive the world as "changing patterns and colors" due to her inability to synthesize the information necessary to form a coherent perspective (Glancy, 2009, p. 118). While Kateri can sense and smell the devastation brought about by the French in her village due to her poor vision, she cannot truly comprehend the state of her land. Nonetheless, she remains devoid of any sense of location. Kateri's impaired vision presents a formidable challenge in her efforts to grasp the concept of a geographically placed body and connect with the rooms and environments she inhabits (Glancy, 2009).

Additionally, the entire landscape associated with an external invasion serves a dual purpose. It serves to highlight Kateri's visionary power, her ability to foresee the future of the land, knowledge that eludes her family. She immerses herself in the acoustic world of the old land by discerning the sound-events that embody the voice of the earth. Kateri shares her connection to the wilderness. Rather than using visual vocabulary to describe the forest, she employs auditory terminology. When crossing the "trees of the forest," Kateri doesn't rely on her sight but, instead, hears "their voices" to distinguish one from another (Glancy, 2009, p. 17). This indicates that Kateri exists as a sentient being in a forest teeming with trees, enveloped by an aural world that Glancy (2009) meticulously constructs. The ground carpeted in pine needles, the intricate spider webs, and the nests nestled in the trees, all are known to Kateri (Glancy, 2009, p. 18). However, due to their small size and Kateri's weak vision, these elements cannot be directly seen or felt; they can only be perceived and experienced through auditory sensations. Each object generates a distinct sound event, and these events gradually coalesce to form the larger sound-shapes of the forest, a feat Kateri accomplishes through her acute auditory awareness.

Furthermore, this study gains insight into Kateri's attendance at church services in another chapter of the book. Here, Glancy constructs a church soundscape in which several sound-events occur. Kateri can hear the voices of the priests in the chapel, even though she struggles to comprehend their words. Her lack of linguistic knowledge hampers her full participation in the service, despite her role in shaping the soundscape (Glancy, 2009). Glancy also employs audio analogies to describe Kateri's visions. To do so, she creates small soundscapes that feature sound-events from Kateri's visions. Kateri perceives the "soundtrack of evil on the wicked" (Glancy, 2009, p. 42) during her journey. On this trek, Kateri also tunes into the voices of the forest, constituting yet another soundscape. Within this auditory realm, one can hear the "voices in the earth" speaking through the thoughts of animals, the rumble of thunder and storms "under the animal skin," and the "tongues of dust and wind" (Glancy, 2009, p. 44). Some of these sound events have a tangible, physical existence that can be deemed real in some sense. However, others, like "thunder and storm under the animal skin," are purely products of Kateri's subconscious and do not manifest in the physical world. Nevertheless, their significance to the overall soundscape cannot be dismissed. This strengthens the argument that Glancy (2009) constructs soundscapes by incorporating both concrete and

abstract sound events that transpire within Kateri's mind. These narratives and incidents underscore the deliberate construction of sensual geographies by Glancy (2009), positioning the main character within the specific geography through the reception of various sensual geographies. This reified sensory experience of geography pits the main character against the patriarchal hegemony of Indigenous American space and place. This interplay between space, place, and gender underscores the significance of the geographical separation of the Indigenous American social structure into public and private realms. Within these gendered places, the dynamics of embodiment, gender roles, relationships, and sexuality are woven, influencing and being influenced by space and place. The intricate interrelationships between space, place, and gender within the context of Native American literature have not only enriched our understanding of these narratives but also provided a platform for further explorations in the ever-evolving field of literary geography and gender studies. By challenging and redefining normative geographies, it invites us to contemplate the nuanced spatial experiences of those who have historically been marginalized.

Conclusion

The idea of "out of place" has been a pivotal concept explored in modern academia. It serves to illuminate the nuances of how individuals' actions and bodies can be perceived as transgressions within specific spatial paradigms. The body, both a physical entity and a cultural artifact, has emerged as a significant determinant of spatiality, incorporating various facets that influence one's sense of place and positionality. This research recognizes the physiological dimension of space and place in the experiences of Indigenous American women's bodies with the contextualization of their existential experience, sensory geography, and the concept of the "crippled body" (Ralph, ---; Rodaway, ----; Moss, --- &Dyck --). Concerning this contextualization, there is a substantial body of literature concerning Indigenous American literature and geography wherein the experiences of Indigenous American women investigate the way they perceive, experience, and challenge normative geographies, both in pre- and post-contact eras. Unlike some earlier studies that treat geography and the environment merely as backdrops to Indigenous American narratives, this research emphasizes the centrality of spatial concepts in shaping difference, resistance, and marginalization. This intricate connection between space, place, and gender within the realm of Indigenous American literature is a journey through interdisciplinary landscapes, where literature, geography, and gender studies converge to create a comprehensive understanding of the spatial dimensions in Indigenous American narratives. This rich interplay of geographical and literary elements helps readers understand the overarching theme that is the pervasive influence of place and space in Indigenous American literature. This concept of space and time examined through a multitude of perspectives highlights how Indigenous American writers explore the complexities of characters' positioning within their environments.

References

Book name must be in italic not the publisher revise

Cresswell, T. (2010). Place: A Short Introduction (2004). *Society and Space*, *28*, 17-31.

Cresswell, T. (1996). Geography, Ideology, and Transgression. In *place/out of Place: Geography, ideology, and transgression* (pp. 21-63). The University of Minnesota Press Minneapolis.

Glancy, D. (2009). *The Reason for Crows: A Story of KateriTekakwitha*. State University of New York Press.

Moss, P., &Dyck, I. (1999). Identity, the body and women with chronic illness. *Embodied geographies: Spaces, bodies and rites of passage*, *2*, 157.

Rodaway, P. (1994). *Sensuous geographies*. London: Routledge.

Rodaway, P. (2005). Exploring the subject in hyper-reality. In *Mapping the Subject* (pp. 222-245). Routledge.

Massey, D. B., & Jess, P. (1995). A place in the world? Places, cultures and globalization.

Massey, D. (2004). *Space, Place and Gender (1994)*. Minneapolis, MN: U of Minnesota.

Moss, P., &Dyck, I. (2012). Material bodies precariously positioned: women embodying chronic illness in the workplace: Pamela Moss and Isabel Dyck. In *Geographies of Women's Health* (pp. 243-259). Routledge.

Monk, J. & Hanson, S. (1982). On not excluding half the human in geography. *Professional Geographer*, 34 (1), 11 – 23.

Sack, J. J. (1993). *From Jacobite to conservative*. Cambridge University Press.

Tuan, Y. F. (1998). *Escapism*. JHU Press.

Tuan, Y. F. (1977). *Space and place Minneapolis*. Minnesota: University of Minnesota.

Wright, J. K. (1947). Terrae Incognitae: The place of the imagination in geography. *Annals of the association of American geographers*, *37*(1), 1-15.