



RESEARCH PAPER**Cultural Institutions in Pakistan: Promoting Cultural and National Identity**

¹Dr. Muhbat Ali Shah* and ²Dr. Muhammad Shahban Sahito

1. Assistant Professor Department of Anthropology and Archaeology, University of Sindh, Jamshoro, Sindh, Pakistan
2. Assistant Professor, Department of International Relations, University of Sindh, Jamshoro, Sindh Pakistan

***Corresponding Author**muhbatshah@usindh.edu.pk

ABSTRACT

The study reviews existing scholarship on identity politics. It explores the preservation of cultural and national identity within Pakistani cultural institutions, examining how we collectively identify with or differentiate ourselves from others. Another important dimension is the state's function as a regulator in forming the identity for the population, especially in divisions based on ethnicity, culture, or religion. The study used a qualitative approach to analyze various resources, including books, internet sources, and interviewed nine senior staff members from cultural institutions and universities in Islamabad, as well as provincial officials in Sindh, to gain valuable insights into Pakistan's cultural preservation efforts. Study's findings, Pakistan has several cultural institutions tasked with preserving its cultural and national identity. However, these institutions frequently serve the cultural agenda, blurring the line between their respective objectives. This study suggests understanding the issues surrounding cultural and national identity in Pakistan, highlighting recent works on identity, becoming familiar with scholarship on these topics, and developing models for policymakers to incorporate these issues into provincial and national policy development.

KEYWORDS Cultural Identity, Cultural Institution, Ethnographic, Ethnological Museums, National Identity

Introduction

There are many interesting aspects of identity as the subject of identity can be approached in different ways. Identity is something we associate with or to distinguish ourselves with others. So it is in both ways to identify or to distinguish with others, that we claim we have identity (G. Anderson, 2004). Further argues that the same sense of association or distinguishing from others make us shape our views about our identity as individual, in a group or in a society as a whole. Another interesting dimension identified by Iliana Giorgi, based on Bilgrami explanation of how the political identity is formed (Weil, 2007). The argument goes as we face or confront a new and mysterious phenomenon that intrigues us, our perception about identity or self-conception is triggered. This is done in the context of a wish to continue with the same value system that we follow, hence find every new thing as challenging (Heuken, Schüder, & Christian, 2021). This indicates people propagate as well as defend their identity. This conceptual knowledge about identity on the individual level help us to determine about ourselves as well as about others in the society through social relation. For the sake of this term paper, we are delving on the social and political dimension of identity more than the personal identity. It is argued that for multi-cultural society, an overarching

national identity is mandatory to keep it functional. However, it is difficult to maintain this identity due to dealing with people from different cultures (Overskaug, Steffensen, & Andersen, 2022). literature review compares the Pakistani diaspora with other ethnic identities in Scotland, and found that ethnic Pakistani migrated to Scotland have more identification with Scotland which is due to cultural identities such as being Muslim were found stronger than territorial identities. There is growing literature on how population is aggregated to a collective body in places like Russia to build national identity through the concept of bio-politics. Bio-politics is how humans relate when they come together in a collective body. It is especially interesting to study in view of dispersed identities and ideological divides (D. Anderson, Storksdieck, & Spock, 2007). Makarychev and Yatsyk discussed the modern state power to administer and regulate individual lives in view of Michel Foucault's theory to discipline the population in terms of managing the all attributes which makes the identity based on self-other distinction. The scholarship on identity involves discussion on sex, race, and ethnicity in the realm of public sphere from their private affair. Another interesting dimension is in the absence of civil society, bio-politics becomes the tool in the hands of powerful to impose their interests on the larger population in the name of identity (Makarychev & Yatsyk, 2019). On the other hand, globalization has transformed the power of nation state beyond borders, which is manifested through refugee crisis, displaced population, trans-border terrorism and increasing number of countries taking stringent measures such as border security, increased resource investment in the security measures, and the scholarship on conflict resolution. While these are challenges faced by developing and developed countries somewhat alike, the developing countries have to bear the larger part of it, due to insistent policies, political turmoil and dependency on the western countries in all walks of life (Makarychev & Yatsyk, 2017). On the local front, concerning the identities, of two of the most debated tribal ethnicities in Pakistan, Baloch and Pushtun, in Balochistan and the then North-Western Frontier Province (now Khyber Pakhtunkhwa). Paul Titus (1998) in his article "Honor the Baloch, Buy the Pushtun: Stereotypes, Social Organization and History in Western Pakistan", elaborates in details the context of tribal administration during the colonial period in the subcontinent of Indo-Pak. His thesis provides interesting elements in how the stereotypes are developed about certain features of cultural phenomenon associated with the groups of people, through measures of coercion and intimidation, for instance, "Rule the Punjabis, intimidate the Sindhis, buy the Pushtuns and honor the Baloch". His insertion that these are often simplification and generalization based on the complex phenomenon. According to him, there is a need to understand that construction of these categories should be placed in the historical and cultural context. His thesis that even people belonging to those identities have the same sets of understandings or misunderstandings about each other based on age old insertions made about these ethnicities by the British during the colonial period (Bond, 2017). Any debate on identities therefore should consider these factors in the historical factors. The objective of the research is to know how do cultural institutions promote and preserve cultural and National identity in Pakistan.

Literature Review

Museums function as essential custodians of cultural legacy, safeguarding the past and presenting it to present and future generations. Serving as centres of knowledge and education, museums hold a pivotal position in fostering learning, tourism, and the conservation of cultural identity. This review delves into the multifaceted functions of museums, highlighting their societal significance and the contemporary challenges they confront (Titus, 1998). The Evolution of Museums the origins of museums can be traced back to ancient civilizations, where assortments of

artifacts were curated for various purposes. However, the contemporary museum, as we recognize it today, emerged during the Renaissance and Enlightenment eras, progressing from cabinets of curiosities into structured institutions dedicated to education and public involvement (Puri, 1995). The 19th and 20th centuries witnessed a proliferation of museums globally, reflecting escalating interests in scientific exploration, cultural heritage, and national identity (Sheikh, 2018). Functions and Roles of Museums Museums fulfill diverse roles within society, encompassing education, conservation, research, and community engagement. Educational initiatives provided by museums cater to individuals of all ages, offering interactive experiences that enrich comprehension and appreciation across various domains, ranging from art and history to science and technology (Titus & Swidler, 2000). Moreover, museums play a pivotal role in safeguarding cultural heritage by curating and preserving artifacts, artworks, and historical records for posterity (Giorgi, 2019). Visitor Experience and Engagement the visitor experience stands at the core of museum success, prompting institutions to continuously explore innovative methods to engage audiences and ensure accessibility to diverse communities (Lenovský, 2015). Studies on visitor behavior and audience research have become integral to museum practices, informing exhibition designs, programming, and outreach initiatives aimed at enhancing visitor satisfaction and educational outcomes (Bögre, 2021). Challenges and Prospects Despite their profound societal impact, museums encounter various challenges in the 21st century, including financial sustainability, relevance to audiences, and ethical considerations concerning collections management and repatriation (Cass, 2018). Additionally, the advent of the digital age has revolutionized the consumption of cultural content, necessitating museums to adapt to new technologies and online platforms while preserving physical artifacts (Cass). Museums serve as crucial custodians of cultural heritage, facilitating public education and fostering dialogue and understanding among diverse communities. As dynamic entities, museums must evolve continuously to meet the evolving needs and expectations of their audiences while upholding their fundamental values of preservation, education, and inclusivity.

Material and Methods

The present paper “Ethnology of Cultural Institutions in Pakistan: Toward Promoting Cultural and National Identity” is based on the qualitative research first hand field work Primary data and In-depth interviews from the Directors of the Federal and Provincial Museums, Archaeologists, Academician. We have also used secondary data for the literature review of this research paper. We conducted the open ended questions. We started our research with the literature review on identity, cultural, political identity and the national identity. We have also reviewed literature on role of cultural institutions in preserving cultural and national identity. Several research articles have been accessed through Quaid-i-Azam University web portal. The findings and analysis is based on books, articles and online resource including the webpages of the cultural institutions in Pakistan. Interviews were conducted with the nine key staff at the cultural institutions/ universities in Islamabad and at the provincial level in Sindh. This made it possible for the team to develop an understanding on how the institutions at multiple levels promote and preserve the cultural and national identity.

Table 1
List of participants in the In-depth interviews

No	Date of Interview	Name of participant	Designation	Organization	Ministry / Department	Region / Province
1	22 nd December 2017	Dr. Fouzia Saeed	Executive Director	National Institute of Folk &	Ministry of Information, Broadcasting	Islamabad

				Traditional Heritage (Lok Virsa)	& National Heritage, Government of Pakistan	
2	22 nd December 2017	Qamar Abbas	Deputy Director	National Institute of Folk & Traditional Heritage (Lok Virsa)	Ministry of Information, Broadcasting & National Heritage, Government of Pakistan	Islamabad
3	22 nd December 2017	Waqar Hanif	Consultant	Pakistan National Council of the Arts	Ministry of Information, Broadcasting & National Heritage, Government of Pakistan	Islamabad
4	22 nd December 2017	Arif Jafri	Consultant	Pakistan National Council of the Arts	Ministry of Information, Broadcasting & National Heritage, Government of Pakistan	Islamabad
5	28 th December 2017	Huzoor Buksh Channa	Librarian	National Institute of Historical and Cultural Research (NIHCR)	Quaid-i- Azam University	Islamabad
6	28 th December 2017	Dr. Sajid M. Awan	Ex-In-charge, NIHCR	National Institute of Historical and Cultural Research (NIHCR)	Quaid-i- Azam University	Islamabad
7	28 th December 2017	Dr. Ishaque Samejo	Director	Sindhology Institute	Sindhology Institute	Jamshoro Hyderabad.
8	28 th December 2017	Professor Dr Mukhtar Ahmed Qazi	Professor of Archaeology	Visiting Professor Anthropology & Archaeology Department	University of Sindh, Jamshoro	University of Sindh, Jamshoro
9	29 th December 2017	Ali	Lecturer	Anthro and Arch Department	University of Sindh, Jamshoro	University of Sindh, Jamshoro

Cultural and National Identity in Pakistan

Pakistan offers a tapestry of culture spread over centuries. The cultural heritage is distinct by the time periods of Indus civilization; Gandhara civilization; Islamic period; Sikh period; British period and Post-independence periodⁱⁱ. While there are some differences on how these periods are described. Another significant work is "Pakistani Culture: A Profile", by Yusuf Abbasi published in 1992 by the National Institute of Historical and Cultural Research, Islamabad. The discussion on cultural and national identity is not without touching upon the issues of identity, culture and the structures. What constitutes Pakistani cultural identity and the role of cultural institutions to preserve and promote this identity? Before we delve further we need to link the cultural and national identity with the shared past of the country which now

constitute Pakistan. The interview conducted at the Pakistan National Council of Arts PNCA was evident of the finding that unless we know in depth about how culture is deeply rooted in the ancient history, oral and written text and other means, we may never be able to develop a comprehensive policy overarching the work of cultural institutions in Pakistan. The interviews at the National Institute of Historical and Cultural Research (NIHCR) further show, the need to address interconnecting issues. It is important to set the time and space of cultural heritage of Pakistani Culture. As described by M. Yusuf Abbasi (1992), Mortimer Wheeler traced back the cultural boundaries to 3rd millennium B.C. This period is manifested by the civilizations of Mohen-Jo Daro in Sindh and Harrapa in Punjab. This also proved that civilizations in Mohen-Jo-Daro and Harrapa were the contemporary civilizations to the Egyptian and Sumerian civilizationsⁱⁱⁱ. People of Indus Civilization used trade, through sea and land route, and the exchange of rich artefacts from the neighbouring Gulf States. This shows the historical link between the geographical regions that were to become Pakistan and neighbouring in the Arab peninsula, and thus shows the influence thereafter. This civilization and its catchment area determine up to a large extent the physical boundaries of Pakistan. Together with Indus River, it provides a natural contributing base to the Pakistan. The water flowing in river Sindh from the upper north to central Punjab and southern part of Pakistan where it unifies with the sea, has seen people century after century using rich resource for agriculture, trade and arts and crafts. The life that is spent along with river Indus and its tributaries gradually knits together culture that is woven with romances, folktales of human struggle against natural and man-made onslaught of disasters, myths, religions, sprouted from based on interaction with the traders, reformers and invaders.

Results and Discussion

There are several cultural institutions in Pakistan whose mandate is to preserve the cultural and national identity. The line is however blurred and most of these serve in their own respect to serve the cultural agenda, according to the objectives maintained for these organizations. The organizations have been divided in the public and private ownership. These include, cultural institutions, like Pakistan National Council of the Arts (PNCA), and Lok Virsa and a vast range of museums. Further, the organizations claim that preserving the national identity is under their ambit. There are also administrative division of these organizations between the centre at the federal level and the provinces. Moreover, in the backdrop of 18th amendment, the provinces faced many challenges due to capacity gaps in taking care of the cultural organizations at the provincial level.

Role of Cultural Institutions in promotion of National and Cultural Identity

Lok Virsa's mandate according to its executive director has traditionally been on preserving and documenting the cultural heritage however it has also included promotion of cultural heritage in tangible and intangible manner during the past few years. Its mandate is also to create space for diversity, and promote democratic values in the country through preserving and promotion of culture. The Executive Director interviewed at Lok Virsa, shared many instances where the organization has been instrumental in promoting and preserving local culture of various communities which face extinction in the wake of popular culture. For instance, activities for the promotion of Kailasha culture and Gilgit Baltistan and Chitral culture through "Chimadori Bazam" concept, with artists and those interested in music get together in the evening to enjoy music. The institute not only promoted the local culture but also in a trans-culture tradition, like that of a program on Rumi which promoted Sufi traditions beyond

borders and national boundaries. The Heritage Museum at Lok Virsa showcases culture and traditions of various communities in Pakistan. It also presents display of traditional folktales in a beautiful manner. Lok Virsa has also been undertaking efforts to revive the classic cinema in Pakistan. A shift is observed where focus of the institute is more cultural diversity and pluralistic values and on cultivating national and international collaborations through organizing variety of seminars, symposium, workshops and programs at Lok Virsa, jointly with national and international organizations. It is collaborating with other organizations like Faiz Ghar in co-arranging activities such as performance by child artists at Faiz International Festival at Alhamra, Lahore. International days have also been celebrated such as International Museum Day. It has been organizing the events like Euro Village to work together by the European Union to have their cultural stalls. Lok Virsa is also organizing events like Christmas and Nowruz to show solidarity with the communities in Pakistan and show a strong sense of pluralism in the country. Nowruz is the announcement of spring season, and is celebrated in Pakistan by various communities such as Wakhi, Shina and Balti, Barushashki and Khuwar, Hazaras, Ismailis and Parsis and Bah'ai communities. Lok Virsa has also been using the modern mode of communication such as online streaming on You Tube and social media and recording the programs on TV, and videography. The institute has also been undertaking digitization of its archives. It is striving its best to make the data available on a digital format available for general access. Another cultural institute visited by the Research team was Pakistan National Council of the Arts, where the seemingly more focus is on promotion of culture through organizing cultural events at the PNCA itself and at the forums provided by aligned ministries and institutions for national and international conferences, delegates, etc. There is some difference noted in the presentation of performing art events such as dances, an earlier publication by the PNCA, namely Folk Dances of Pakistan has a variety of dances that signify the rural colours for instance cotton pickers dance, Basant bhangra dance, Mohen-Jo-Daro dance, fisherman dance, harvest dance, snake charmers dance, Dhammal dance, Marriage ceremony dance, etc. A recent publication of an event organized by the PNCA, Colours of Pakistan specify the dances but with more focus on nuances of the dances and technique, and less on different facets of life that these depict. Another feature shared with the team was the quarterly publication of Saqafat (Culture) by the PNCA, which has been out of print since ages. The latest issue that we saw was during the tenure of the then Director General, Khalid Saeed Butt, and the first year in seat of General Zia ul Haq. The council for consultation of the mentioned publication comprise names such as Dr Ahmed Hassan Dani, Dr. NA Baloch. It starts with the message of Quaid-e-Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah in his 1946 address to the Muslim members of the then provincial and national assemblies, as part of an oath, where the members vow that they should not agree on any suggestion to rule which is without their agreement, and to revolt if suggested otherwise. Along with it, pictures of the Quaid-e-Azam were presented that show of his modern vision, through depiction of his dress, a blend of eastern and western, with both sherwani clad and in three piece suit in a swing, and with cigar and playing billiard, enjoying his time at Ziarat residency at the brink of a stream. Khalid Saeed Butt in his preamble combines many issues related to the culture, with lots of conditioned statements, such as:

“If we the people of Pakistan would realize in a true sense our common cultural heritage and national identity, we will be successful in discovering our true potential, and the factors which will keep us resilient and keep our nation strong with the changing times.” (Excerpt from Preamble to Quarterly Saqafat, April – June 1978, by Khalid Saeed Butt, Translated by Muhbat Ali Shah Ahmed, from Urdu to English)

Similarly, the editorial statement also indicates the need to determine cultural priorities. It is very important to see in the context of a martial law of General Zia ul Haq that has just started in the country, which has shelved many steps taken during his predecessor, Zulfikar Ali Bhutto's rule.

"The responsibility for the promotion of national arts and culture and to protect them against cultural onslaught from outside the country is on our means of communication and to use them purposefully depend on the national cultural policy to determine our cultural values and how to prioritize among those values. The objective of this policy is to sustain the sense of historical continuity with the real time changes in the society, but also to keep the cushion of changes and modifications in the changing dialectics of the society." (Excerpt from Editorial to Quarterly Saqafat, April - June 1978, by Mustansar Javed, Translated by Muhsat Ali Shah, from Urdu to English)

This publication has many highlights that specify what the officials of the Pakistan National Council of the Arts were thinking on the key issues which promote the national identity as well as provide a justification of sustenance of the institute. For instance, one of the article highlights need of a theatre to promote national identity, presentation of national heritage, and project the government in one go, with the example of European theatre. Another article about the paintings of Ustad Allah Bakhsh highlights the various schools of thought such as the one led by Abdul Rehman Chughtai, the Mughul Miniature art, and the surreal art led by Shakir Ali and naturalist school led by Ustad Allah Bakhsh, with the priority for Ustad Allah Baksh on account of its natural, mass appeal, and connectivity with the common man. This show that the system of government and the priority of the party politics during the time of Bhutto were still resonant, even a year after Bhutto's government was replaced by General Zia Ul Haq's martial law in Pakistan. The diversity of culture is beautifully projected in an article on "Prayers for Rain", where the writer gives a detailed account of prayers by children for rain, and other acts performed such as annoying an elderly person both man and woman, by throwing water on them, and in return their use of foul language, obscenities, thinking that this would bring rain, in the local culture in Pakistan. Keeping in view the transition from Bhutto regime to the Zia regime, Government started its preservation and purification of culture project through other institutions than the ones mentioned, one such institution is National Institute of Historical and Cultural Research which was initiated as a constituent institute of the Quaid-i-Azam University in April 1979, and later as part of the then Government's efforts of connecting it with the religion, it was transferred to the Islamic University in two years of its making in March 1981. It was re-named as Institute of Islamic History, Culture and Civilization. Soon it was returned to its parent university in August 1983. It is now a centre of excellence in History and Culture. Its mandate covers assessment of research in South Asia and Pakistan and promotion and preservation of historical and cultural records, and commissioning of scholarly works on history and culture.

Interviews at the provincial level in Sindh show that the Institute of Sindhology's mandate is to preserve cultural studies related to Sindh such as Sindh's History, Culture, Archaeology, Anthropology, Languages, Rituals, Traditions, Customs Music, Art, Folklore, Myths, tangible and intangible culture etc. There are three major departments in the institute: Sindh Gallery/Museum in which Sindh's Cultures is displayed. Audio and Visual sections in which Interviews, Music, Sites, Documentary and different TV Channels of Sindhi Content, are preserved, and Multi-disciplinary research library/institute. "Sindhology has translations cell / Bureau which translates different literature / books / history in Sindhi language. Research work of Sindhology is published in Books and Journals of Sindhology. Scholars are facilitated for research

work on all aspects of Sindh's culture. Sindhology promotes local culture by arranging exhibitions at local, national and international level. Galleries are displayed in this museum in order to promote and preserve Sindh's culture. Sindhology has also preserved period wise archaeological sites of Sindh." (Director of Sindhology interview at Sindhology Institute, Jamshoro, Sindh)

The simplicity of our rural life as depicted through the bullock cart thousands of years back in the Indus Civilization is still found alive in the rural areas in Sindh and Punjab. In view of these existent cultural symbols, and rich heritage of both tangible and intangible nature, why were we not successful in consolidating and finalizing our very own cultural policy? There may be various reasons; one of those remained the pre-Islamic religious influence. The civilizations dated back five thousand years would have influence of other religions, which the policy makers found it hard to mute. Hence the conflict would not allow the draft cultural policy to become an approved document, unless the inherent conflict is resolved.

Most key informants have not distinguished the works present at their centres or museums based on ethnology or ethnography. The Director at the Sindhology Institute shared that their institute is responsible on one hand for publishing and dissemination of research conducted on culture.

"We preserve culture through audio and videos archives. We also collect the archaeological artefacts and display them at our museum. This is where we have records and artefacts from different regions in Sindh; hence it will be termed as ethnological. However, we also publish ethnographic data at the research library of Sindhology. So it is mix of both ethnology and ethnography. Sindhology institute organizes national and international conferences in order to promote the culture. The institute arranges cultural book fairs, folk art festivals, folk music programs, cultural award ceremonies and invite folk artists from all over Pakistan for the Promotion of Culture." (Director of Sindhology interview at the Institute of Sindhology, Jamshoro)

"Sindhology is the cultural forum which encourages the local and national artists to show their talent and promote their regional culture at national and international level. It is not an autonomous institute. It is government by university of Sindh, and it does not receive any federal funding. It has very limited resources and funding which is not enough. The institute must be autonomous and independent and it should have separate board of governors and budget to perform independently." (Director of Sindhology interview at the Institute of Sindhology, Jamshoro)

Presenting and Promoting Tangible and Intangible Culture

The Consultant at the PNCA shared that since the independence of Pakistan, efforts have been underway to preserve and promote culture in both tangible and intangible form. This includes literature, paintings, works of arts, performing arts, music, etc, and the more tangible forms such as archaeological sites, etc. Writers, painters and artists like Abdul Rehman Chughtai, Faiz Ahmed Faiz, Ustad Allah Baksh had experienced life both prior to and after partitions, and have been established in their respective fields. The overarching role of religion which was considered as a binding force to unify the federating units, in Pakistan was a new reality, which was difficult for the writers and artists associated with the progressive writer's forum. The ruling elite in Pakistan made every effort to delink the shared past between Muslims and Hindus, in similar manner as was done in India, where Urdu as language got dominated by Hindi in the popular sense. While in Pakistan English remained the *lingua Franca*, however

Urdu was considered as representing the symbolic unity. This has on one hand affected the mutual relationship between people of West Pakistan and that of East Pakistan. Hence writers like Faiz Ahmed Faiz were felt disoriented in the initial years of Pakistan. The intellectuals in those days felt that they had to struggle further to create an ideal world for have nots. Painters like Abdul Rehman Chughtai were state patronized as they have connected the new realities with the paintings of Muslim glory, which was highlighted through the works such as *Muraqa e Chughtai*, and *Amal e Chughtai*. On one hand, Chughtai and Sadeqain were painting the couplets of Iqbal and Ghalib, and on other painters like Ustad Allah Bakhsh were painting the village life in Pakistan.

“The painters like Abdul Rehman Chughtai contributed in linking Pakistan with the Muslim culture. Ustad Allah bakhsh used village life to depict rural life in Pakistan which shows unified imagery, mostly of western Pakistan folk tales, romances of Sohni Mahiwal, Heer Ranjha, Mirza Sahiban, and various dimensions of rural life, in a blend of imaginative and real life. Artists like Anna Molka Ahmad and Ghulam Rasool painted the contemporary and modern life in the streets, and bazars of Pakistan. On the modern tone, painters like Shakir Ali, Anwer Jalal Shemza, Bashir Mirza, Hajira Mansoor, Zubaida Agha etc ste the tone for a more modern, Pakistan with the use of abstractionism” (Excerpt from key informant interview at the PNCA, Islamabad)

It is not that the painters in Pakistan were without their ordeal. Sadeqain suffered due to his bold style in painting, which almost cost him his life and sanity, as he was so discouraged due to the puritan state of mind, that tried to purge the ones it did not like as part of the mainstream work of art or culture, to the extent that he resorted to calligraphy, which to some was a refuge. This shows the shifty grounds through which the dissenting voice was discouraged, using religion, and national agenda. The works of National College of Arts in Lahore, Departments of Arts at the public universities at the KP and Sindh have contributed majorly toward preserving the art and culture, however there is less representation of Balochistan in the mainstream work of art and culture, which needs to be encouraged for their fair representation in the cultural life at the national level. Many progressive writers such as Ahmed Nadim Qasmi’s writings also represent rural life in the changing times. While writers like Qurat ul Ain were writing the great works on the larger impact of partition in the epic work *Aag ka Darya* (The river of fire). In the mainstream work, and in the corridors of power one things was common, to establish link between the Muslims with the geographic entities where Pakistan is situated. For many years, the local culture and sub-cultures were dominated by this wishful thinking for the search of a unifying force that should gel the pieces together in a jigsaw puzzle of culture. Hence the question of promotion and preserving the national identity remained supreme and institutions were developed for the promotion of national identity through depicting Pakistan as a unit, a natural collection of geographic regions bound to be together. The projects like National Council of the Arts and Lok Virsa were the institutions to propagate solidarity among people from different ethnicities and multiple identities under one banner, that is their prime identity as a Muslim, and then the caste identity and the regional identity, such as a Pashtun, a Punjabi, a Sindhi, a Baluchi, etc. Interviews with Director of the Sindhology institute Jamshoro, especially in Sindh throw some light of dynamics of identity politics.

“We have restriction from the state that we should limit our culture at local and regional level but we claim that we (Sindhi) belong to Indus Civilization and cannot restrict our culture at local and regional level and want to promote our national identity at national and international level. (Excerpt from key informant interview at the Institute of Sindhology, Jamshoro, and Sindh)

It is further shared that in Sindh each ethnic group is unique because these groups possess their own identity, folklore, folk music, folk dance, cultural dress and unique language which makes Sindh's culture more beautiful and strong. It is therefore needed to promote all the sub-cultures of Sindh. So the main objective of Sindhology is that neglected sub-culture is to be promoted and preserved and their link to the national identity should be explored. It is shared that Sindhology could arrange festivals about these subgroups / ethnic groups of Sindh and could ensure their participation in all the cultural events in order to promote their identity and culture. However, they lacked adequate funding as Sindhology can promote national identity and culture at national and international level. Soon after Pakistan came in to being, it faced many challenges such as national identity, education and core issues related to national and regional languages. Pakistan is facing after 70 years the same issues which need to be addressed.

"Pakistani politics is being controlled on the bases of culture, ethnicities and languages." (Key informant interview at the Institute of Sindhology, Jamshoro) Like other post-colonial states, there is much critique on politics of language, culture and ethnicities in Pakistan. The post-colonial states were not inclusive, as the elite / ruling class did not want that people who belong to different ethnic groups, culture, languages should remain together. Ruling class got political domination and they suppressed, controlled local culture, and languages for their own benefit. So, political crises emerged after controlling the regional and local cultures and languages, especially in the provinces without majority. During the period of Quaid-i- Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah, issue based on language and identity emerged because he preferred Urdu over Bengali language as national language for united Pakistan, consisting of majority population from East Pakistan. It was a move with far reaching consequences in identity politics in Pakistan. On the other hand, in India, Nehru did not impose Hindi languages on all provinces and gave equal status to the regional languages as national languages. It is shared that the provincial languages should be given the national status otherwise lack of trust would be developed among provinces. Cultural intuitions are not functional. Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto founded many cultural intuitions for the promotion but General Zia ul Haq made all those cultural intuitions non-functional.

Museums and Cultural Institutions: Whether Ethnological or Ethnographic

Discussions with the key informants show the difference between ethnography and ethnology. Ethnography is based on writing about people of a particular culture. While ethnology is comparative study of cultures. An ethnographic study is based on the cultural anthropology's assumption of holism, meaning the whole is greater than the sum of the individual cultural parts. So according to cultural anthropologists, a culture as a whole can be studied through study of various aspects. Ethnography collects data about particular cultures, through field work. The field work for an anthropologist is living and breathing the same space as are the participants in the research, for an extended time period. While ethnology, another name for cultural anthropology, is the comparative study of cultures. Ethnographies provide the basic and raw data for ethnology for further analysis. As cultures vary from region to region, so it is important to study specific cultures to note or record these variations, as part of ethnographic studies. These when compared with each other, form ethnology.

In view of discussion with key informants, the team developed understanding based on which Taxila Museum could be termed as ethnographic as it gives detailed account of Gandhara civilization. Lahore Museum is ethnological as it comprises many ethnographic accounts of various cultures in addition to the archaeological study. Rawalpindi Council Arts presents cultural programs to the public. National Museum

Karachi is also ethnological museum. While Mohenjodaro Museum is an ethnographic museum. Ziarat Residency Quetta is also an ethnographic museum. So is Faqeerkhana museum in the private collection of artefacts, and Iqbal Manzil in Lahore. However, Quetta Museum and Peshawar Museum are ethnological museums.

Regarding museums, the key informants in Sindh shared how artefacts are kept for their identification in the museums. These are kept in chronological order and period wise as we can identify culture and civilization from different periods whether that civilization belongs to Stone Age, Bronze Age or Neolithic age. Dates are put on the artefacts to know how old is an artefact, and the place where it is found. When visitors come to visit archaeological museums they see the dates, history, locale and identification of the artefacts.

Those all artefacts indicate about the culture, civilization, activities, trades, religions, and inventions about the peoples of concerned period of the artefacts. Different artefacts of the different periods educate people about the religion, culture, customs, languages and identifications of the Civilizations. (Excerpt from key informant interview in Sindh)

There are fewer museums in Pakistan. If we look at Sindh there are also few Museums such as Karachi museums, Sindh museums Hyderabad and Sindhology Museums. There are not skilled people in the Pakistan museums. (Excerpt from key informant interview in Sindh) the key informants shared that to promote culture through museums, trained and skilled curators of the concerned field should be appointed in all the museums of the Pakistan as they can promote and preserve the culture. People should be made aware of the importance of the museums. Museums field study trip must be made compulsory from the primary to university level as children can think and ask the questions about the civilization, culture. It is further shared that museums should be made in every union council and district of Pakistan, to bring about ethnographic details and perspectives. Same districts history, culture, art, music and artefacts should be displayed as children and people can know their regional, local and national culture of their own region.

Institutional Mechanism to Preserve Culture

The key informants in Sindh shared that budgets are available for the museums but these are not utilized in proper way.

Skilled persons are not hired and they do not know about the utilization and importance of the museums and they are not capable to preserve and make new museums. They are also not able to have liaisons with other national and international museums and they are not capable to promote the museums and they do not have skill to get the funding from other organizations. (Excerpt from key informant interview in Sindh)

According to the respondents from Archaeology department in Sindh, there is no cultural policy for the museums, and a structure to govern museums.

Before the 18th amendment it was blamed that federal authorities were not cooperative but now everything is under control of the province who has prohibited them not to work. They are not working for the museums. Culture department of Sindh has not hired the proper people and they do not know how to promote the culture and museums. There is no cooperation between the province and federal government. It is

duty of provincial government and culture department of Sindh that they must contact with federal government and engage with all national and international level in order to promote their culture. (Excerpt from key informant interview in Sindh)

It is further shared that through use of the digital technology, China, Japan and other European countries developed their museums and equipped with the technology. Museums are completely digitalized in those countries.

When a visitor enters museums in the developed countries, he/she feel in the same atmosphere which is depicted through the technology. (Excerpt from key informant interview in Sindh)

The respondent further shared that there is dire need of technology in the museums that all the museums should be digitalized preserved and promoted through the technology. Museums should be made and opened at every site and every artefact of region and locale sites must be preserved in proper way. Culture department should take the serious efforts to promote the museums. So there have been numerous challenges in the promotion of culture and national identity as culture policy has not been approved in Pakistan. The constitution of Pakistan preserves a distinct culture and practices done through literature, art and crafts and music.

It is evident at the provincial level that there is no role of any federal institution on the cultural policy nor do the federal authorities directly contact the provincial stakeholders about the cultural policy. There is also strong voice in favour of regional languages such as Sindhi to be given status of national language, along with other regional languages, such as Punjabi, Seraiki, Pashto, Shina, Balochi, etc. The informants further stressed that other language and culture should not be imposed on the regional languages, as Urdu is not the mother tongue for majority of people living in Pakistan, but it has been given the status of national language, which is not acceptable to the nationalists and those working for the rights of their own language and culture at the provincial level.

Culture department of Sindh is among those organizations, which has been supportive to Sindhology institute in festivals, folk music and other cultural events. This makes it possible for Sindhology to organize the international and national level conferences and events for the promotion of national identity and culture. Sindhology has also made agreement with Endowment Funding Trust (EFT) who has offered it 10 million pak rupees for the preservation of culture. Academia also supports Sindhology and provides two lac pak rupees every year for the purchasing and publishing of books.

Sindhology has policy in written. Main policy of Sindhology is to preserve various aspects Sindh's Culture and interact with other institutions in order to preserve and promote Sindh's Culture. However, 18th amendment is not implemented in true spirit in Sindh and we have not been benefited from this amendment. (Director of Sindhology interview at the Institute of Sindhology, Jamshoro)

There is also a tradition to give space to major entities on the culture landscape on regional level. There are also subculture and ethnic groups at the provincial level which are ignored and can be promoted through forums like Sindhology.

"Those who only speaks Sindhi language is not only the Sindhi but whoever lives in Sindh and speaks even other language is also a Sindhi." (Director of Sindhology interview at the Institute of Sindhology, Jamshoro)

This also speaks volume about non representation of sub-cultures in the main cultures, which serve further marginalization. Unless the minority ethnic groups are not represented in the mainstream debate on culture, they will feel some reluctance to be identified in the national identity. The key informants also shared that if Pakistan pays full attention to the preservation and promotion of culture then the issues like extremism will be countered, by building alternative narrative to extremist narratives.

Culture is the only tool which can prevent extremism and terrorism. Extremism is developed when there is deviation from the mainstream culture and society. The Art and Culture can change the attitude and mind of the extremist.

The key informants at the federal level shared that they are continuing with digitalizing the archives on the modern lines, aligning it with the requirement of audience who want to use digital means. The key informants at the provincial level however identified many challenges such as to take the Sindhology to E-Sindhology (digitalize/virtual) level. There is also need to digitalize the existing research library of Sindhology. It is further shared that culture can be linked with tourism, so its promotion would become possible. As most cultural institutions have themselves fallen victim to extremism and intolerance, so there is ban on the dance, music and theatre. There is only limited issues that can be dealt with through theatre, and many topics are taboo subjects.

“It is our dream that a person may access the resource on culture while sitting at any place in the world. Sindhology has major challenge of funding; it has not enough funding as we can work further on the other new projects.”(Director of Sindhology interview at the Institute of Sindhology, Jamshoro).

Conclusion

Respondents interviewed claimed Pakistan’s rich cultural heritage which dates back thousands of years, through the civilizations such as Indus civilization. However, what matters is that we own this heritage; otherwise all such claims stand void. There is also tradition of selecting a few shots from the heritage. These cannot be done like this. It should be taken as a whole, showing multiple oral, written and visual and performing art traditions. There have been numerous persons in history, who have contributed toward promotion of art and craft. What we inherit today, owe to those rich and diverse contribution through oral history, literature, performing art, visual art and craft. It turned out that a number of institutes in the public and private sphere are contributing to the cultural space consisting of sub-cultures in Pakistan.

References

- Anderson, D., Storksdieck, M., & Spock, M. (2007). Understanding the long-term impacts of museum experiences. *In principle, in practice: Museums as learning institutions*, 197-215.
- Anderson, G. (2004). *Reinventing the museum: Historical and contemporary perspectives on the paradigm shift*: Rowman Altamira.
- Bögre, Z. (2021). Narrative identity as a bridge between two historical models of identity: a sociologist's perspective. *Sociologie Românească*, 19(1), 55-69.
- Bond, R. (2017). Multicultural nationalism? National identities among minority groups in Scotland's census. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 43(7), 1121-1140.
- Cass, N. Claire Robins, *Curious Lessons in the Museum: The Pedagogic Potential of Artists' Interventions*, Farnham: Ashgate Publishing Limited, 2013, hardback, £ 55, pp. 241.
- Cass, N. (2018). Janet Marstine, *Critical Practice: Artists, Museums, Ethics*, Abingdon: Routledge, 2017, paperback £ 31.99, pp. xiv+ 211. *Museum and Society*, 16(1), 107-108.
- Giorgi, L. (2019). Travelling concepts and crossing paths: a conceptual history of identity *The Structural Change of Knowledge and the Future of the Social Sciences* (pp. 47-60): Routledge.
- Heuken, N., Schüder, A.-L., & Christian, A. (2021). Differences between First-Time and Repeat Visitors in a Special Exhibition at a Natural History Museum. *Visitor Studies*, 24(2), 166-183.
- Lenovský, L. (2015). Identity as an Instrument for Interpreting the Socio-cultural Reality. *European Journal of Science and Theology*, 11(5), 171-184.
- Makarychev, A., & Yatsyk, A. (2017). Biopower and geopolitics as Russia's neighborhood strategies: reconnecting people or reaggregating lands? *Nationalities Papers*, 45(1), 25-40.
- Makarychev, A., & Yatsyk, A. (2019). *Critical biopolitics of the post-Soviet: From populations to nations*: Lexington Books.
- Overskaug, K., Steffensen, M., & Andersen, R. (2022). Visit Dynamics of 5-to 19-Year-Olds in a Natural History and Archaeology Museum from 1992 to 2016: Toward the Next Generation Museum. *The International Journal of the Inclusive Museum*, 15(2), 25.
- Puri, B. (1995). Kashmiriyat: The vitality of Kashmiri identity. *Contemporary South Asia*, 4(1), 55-63.
- Sheikh, S. R. (2018). *The genesis of Baloch nationalism: Politics and ethnicity in Pakistan, 1947-1977*: Routledge India.
- Titus, P. (1998). Honor the Baloch, buy the Pushtun: Stereotypes, social organization and history in Western Pakistan. *Modern Asian Studies*, 32(3), 657-687.
- Titus, P., & Swidler, N. (2000). Knights, not pawns: Ethno-nationalism and regional dynamics in post-colonial Balochistan. *International Journal of Middle East Studies*, 32(1), 47-69.

Weil, S. E. (2007). From being about something to being for somebody: The ongoing transformation of the American museum *Museum management and marketing* (pp. 30-48): Routledge.
