

# Pakistan Languages and Humanities Review www.plhr.org.pk

# RESEARCH PAPER

The Impact of Instructional Teaching Methods and Resources on Student's Performance in Girls' Secondary Schools, Chiltan Town, Quetta

# Sabiha Barrech<sup>1\*</sup> Dr. Abdul Nasir Kiazai<sup>2</sup>

- 1. M. Phil Scholar, Institute of Education and Research, University of Balochistan, Quetta, Balochistan, Pakistan
- 2. Director, Institute of Education and Research, University of Balochistan, Quetta, Balochistan, Pakistan

DOI	http://doi.org/10.47205/plhr.2022(6-II)64
PAPER INFO	ABSTRACT
Received: February 28, 2022 Accepted: June 10, 2022 Online: June 12, 2022 Keywords: Teaching Methods, Instructional Resources, Student's	This study examines the impact of instructional teaching methods and resources on student's performance in girl's secondary schools Quetta. This study was quantitative in nature with the sample size of 115 students and 50 teachers, 165 total respondents. Primary data was collected through two different questionnaires consist of close ended questions. One questionnaire was specified for teachers while the other was for students. The data was analyzed through Statistical Package for Social Sciences SPSS version-22, and analyzed data was presented in the form of frequency distribution and percentages. The findings of this study revealed that teachers
Performance	use blend of lectures, groupwork, on a large scale and
*Corresponding	demonstrated to teach secondary school students. It was found
Author  sabiabarrech@gma il.com	that teaching methods have had a positive and negative impact on students performance. The study concludes that teaching methods with the use of instructional resources make effective teaching learning process and contribute to students achievement in secondary schools. It was recommended that government should conduct refresher courses and trainings regarding modern instructional methods and provide instructional resources to secondary schools. It was also recommended that government should provide instructional resources and science equipment in all schools. Teachers should adopt experimental and concept base teaching and their teaching methods and audio visual aids may be according to the level and interest of students.

# Introduction

The word education is derived from Latin term "Educatum" which means training or teaching. Some of Educationalists says it is come out from Latin term "Educare" which means to bring up .As John Dewy explained "Education is a process of living through, a continuous reconstruction of experiences". The process of education or learning is not possible without teaching or instructional methods and resources. These instructional methods directly affect the students' performance. The

word teaching method or methodology denotes to general principles, pedagogy and management plans used for classroom teaching. The term instructional resources or instructional aids refer to materials which a teacher used during teaching for better understanding.

Teaching methods and audio visual aids are the directions or steps followed by the instructors to achieve the learning outcomes of the students. The vital role of the teaching methods and audio visual aids cannot be ignored. The achievements of learning results directly depend on teaching methodologies and instructional aids. Instructional methods involve the learning of particular concepts, the nature of these concepts, and the growth of logical reasoning & critical thinking. The learning styles of students depend on numerous factors in which environmental and other cognitive and emotional factors are included too. As every learner is different from other so it's a worthy idea for teachers or instructors to develop classroom plans in a way that combine different type of learning styles for different types of students.

A hundred of instructional methodologies are presented by educationalists for better teaching and learning. It is likewise a mystery that broad media helps offer ideal types of assistance to empower mutually the student and the teacher in teaching and learning process. Practically all individuals learn in various manners and styles so it is vital that teachers should attempt to fuse whatever number distinctive teaching styles as would be prudent into the conveyance of what they are teaching.

Basileo (2019) argue that the idea of education needs to incorporate positive methodologies and conduct, the capacity to get information, letting understudies to degree their own insight and afterward applying their knowledge to regular daily life. An educator should foster these ideas to help and make students to advance freely, so they might proceed to create and accumulate information until the end of their lives. There are a wide range of theories and approaches on showing methods and styles. Most are agree that all learners ought to have an equivalent involvement with education, teachers should adjust their showing styles so everybody benefits inside the classroom.

Quetta (the capital of Balochistan) having the population of 2.27 million according to 6<sup>th</sup> national census 2017, is allocated into two towns, named Chiltan and Zarghoon town. The rate of literacy of this city is satisfactory as compare to the other districts of province but still there are a lot of educational problems like high dropout, less enrollment, less facilities in schools and lack of schools in many areas of Quetta city. As high dropout has many causes but some where it is related to teachers too.

Some educationalists think that teaching methods and use of instructional resources plays important role in education. The teachers can make their lesson interesting, understandable and can produce skilled human resource through it. Mostly teachers are still using old methods and they do not use instructional resources during their lectures. So they are unable to develop critical thinking and creativity in the students. Many Researches conducted by the educationalists proved that students learning and their performance can easily be effect by no use of instructional aids and traditional, strict and uncreative teaching methods. (Umer & Siddique, 2013, p. 43)

In every school whether it is government or private one can easily judge the effectiveness of teaching methods and proper use of instructional aids by their students. The understanding level and the collective performance of the students show it easily. So the effective learning is directly proportional with use of instructional aids and teaching methods. After the development of curriculum, the government itself and the non-government organizations have paid much emphasis on the improvement on teaching methods. Higher Education Commission and United States aid have done great efforts for pre and post teachers training and for this purpose they developed a detailed syllabus, teaching practice during professional courses and new type of lesson plans which includes effective instructional objectives, proper use of instructional aids and students learning outcomes. It also deals with different types of assessments too. (Akram & Zepeda 2015)

#### Literature Review

According to Meleisea (2005) the whole world is now passing through an unbelievable socio-economic, technical and cultural variation and now it is being more and more interconnected. Alongside this modern age, people who are related to education have the similar opinion that it is very significant to assimilate non educational capabilities keen interested in instruction as well as learning. Therefore it is true that these abilities in 21 century are soft, schema acquiring and standard abilities. In 2013 the United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organization Asia pacific network for research institution conducted annual meeting related to education and adopted specific word "transversal abilities" for the use of all level of attitudes, self-respect, collaboration and all competencies that are needed for a student's development and his capabilities related to adopt change in the environment. On the other side the literature also recommended that the word transversal abilities which are substantial for attainment in school and educational institutions. The combination of transversal capabilities is renowned as being the most dominant change in education field. The study or research on regional base associated to transversal capabilities must understand like preliminary study linked to the assemblage of documentation and experiences. Even though the study or research accompanied on regional basis is having an overall outline of research where it is also vital announce the complication. The effort linked to transversal competency is not easy headed for studying such diverse socio-economic, cultural backgrounds.

For understanding the dissimilarity from country to country, it was decided that every domain of influence would remain common beside this the researchers would have to clarify their personal clarifications related to transversal competencies, it was decided that each sphere of influence is not cooperatively limited as the country or economy might place same abilities inside various sphere of influence. Here are the six domains in defining transversal competencies.

- 1. Serious and inventive thinking
- 2. Interpersonal abilities
- 3. Intrapersonal skills
- 4. Worldwide nationality or citizenship

#### 5. Media information literate

#### 6. Other

According to Ayeni (2011), instruction is a nonstop process which includes taking about desirable variations in students by the usage of suitable teaching methods. Adunola (2011) pointed that in order to bring appropriate changes in learners, instructional methods used by teachers should be finest for the subject matter.

Bharadwaj & Pal (2012) continued that instructional methods graft very effectively mostly if they garb students' requirements since every student take to mean and answers to the queries in a exclusive way (Chang, 2002). As such, arrangement of instructional methods with learners' wants and favored learning effect students' academic achievements (Zeeb, 2019).

Glewwe (2008) gives the idea of pedagogical standards and school assets to an exceptionally intelligent level, characterizing it as considerable speculations and help about learning and teaching of the students. In exact, pedagogical standards and plans, work with the most common way of growing better learning rehearses which, thus, characterize how students will insight, draw in and answer the substance. This rouses better learning results. Ideally, learning and teaching better practices ought to first be said in quite a while and afterward in wording intended for the positive learning climate. Consequently, the teaching as well as learning 'methodologies' is the more substantial activities intended to carry out pedagogical standards and subsequently satisfy or add to expressed points of better school execution.

As indicated by educationalists exercise or subject it isn't intriguing yet the educator can change over it into fascinating through their showing strategies and instructional assets. Two kinds of training techniques are drilled in nation. In rustic zones customary educating is generally drilled by educators however inventive can upgrade the basic reasoning. It can likewise build up the innovativeness among the understudies. Research led through specialist demonstrated the effect of better as well as imaginative encouraging strategies upon execution of under studies education. (Umer & Saddiqui, 2013)

After the advancement of educational modules 2006, the legislature and non-government associations accentuation on showing techniques in our country. Advanced education commission and United States of America presented before and after administration showing program and built up a detail prospectuses. New sorts of exercise plans were presented having understudies learning results, benchmark, guidelines and distinguishing proof of capabilities. It likewise centers on developmental and summative appraisal and instructional materials and so on. (Akram & Zepeda 2015). Educators assume key job in training framework and the person is the specialist of progress. Preparing for expert instructor advancement is currently perceived all around. A sensational change in financial matters, culture, legislative issues and innovation need change in instruction and educating techniques. The psyches of individuals are shifting of patriotism towards spectrum, from straightforward innovation to innovatively joined world. In this circumstance it tends to be the duty of instructor to set up the understudies for a similar change. (Rehmani, 2013).

Classes are changed over from instructor focused to understudy focused. Behaviorism approach of educating isn't supported. The educationalists recommended elective training techniques like development of understudy's little gatherings and enable them to work through critical thinking procedure and trade thoughts with each other's. The benefit of this strategy encourages the understudies to investigate previous information and to upgrade their certainty. In showing technique the understudies move hypothesis into viable. This procedure includes understudies effectively and can build up their community oriented aptitudes, free examination, huge gatherings dialogs and addresses introductions are different sorts of showing techniques which are for the most part energized by the educationalists. (Wong P. 1995).

#### Material and Methods

# Research Design

The research method for this study was quantitative method. Descriptive design was selected. This design was chosen because it focuses on numerical data. Creswell J. (1994) argue that researches are useful, by applying quantitative method approach, researchers can collect, analyze and interpret in a single study. For primary data collection two types of questionnaires were used one questionnaire was used for teachers and other was used for students of secondary classes. Questionnaire was consisted of (20) close handed questions for teachers while the questionnaire used for students was consisted (15) close handed questions.

#### **Data Collection**

The respondents for this study were literate so the data was collected through questionnaires from the sample. Close handed questions were based on Likert scale. The secondary data was collected from multiple resources including various reports published by government of Balochistan, United Nations International Children Emergency Fund and United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organization, Alif Ailaan, Balochistan Education Management Information System data and internet.

# Sampling

The students and teachers who are taken as sample for this study were from girl's high schools only. All public girls' secondary schools of Chiltan Town Quetta were total population. Total girls institutions including primary, middle and high in Chiltan town are (133) and girls' high schools are (29). So (15) girl's high Schools will be selected as sample. Data was collected through random sampling from (165) respondents, (115) students and (50) teachers of targeted field. There will be (07) students and (04) teachers from each school.

# **Data Analysis**

From the targeted field (Chiltan Town) data was collected and analyzed. The quantitative data was statistically analyzed through Statistical Package for Social Sciences version 23. Simple percentage was applied. The obtained result was converted in tabular and graphic form.

#### **Results and Discussion**

Table 1
You are satisfied with new activity base curriculum

104 W10 000 11 11 11 11 W001 11 11 W00 0 W11 11 W11 W		
	Frequency	Percentage
Strongly Disagree	04	8.0
Disagree	02	4.0
Agree	04	8.0
Strongly Agree	40	80.0
Total	50	100.0

The frequency test of the above table clearly shows that (80%) teachers are satisfied with new curriculum while (08%) are agreed while (08%) are strongly disagreed and the remaining (04%) are disagreed.

You are a trained teacher regarding teaching methodologies

104.4104.414.1104	a teacher regarding teaching methodologies	
	Frequency	Percentage
Strongly Agree	6	12.0
Disagree	4	8.0
Agree	10	20.0
Strongly Agree	30	60.0
Total	50	100.0

The concluding part of the above table shows that (60%) of teachers strongly claim that they are trained teachers regarding teaching methodologies, (20%) of teachers agree about their methodologies training. The data also show that (12%) of teachers strongly disagree and (08%) disagree about their trainings regarding teaching methodologies.

Table 3
You are using instructional aids during your lecture

-	Frequency	Percentage
Strongly Disagree	01	2.0
Disagree	08	16.0
Neutral	10	20.0
Agree	11	22.0
Strongly Agree	20	40.0
Total	50	100.0

The above data table explore that (40%) of respondents are strongly agreed that they use instructional aids during their lecture and (22%) were agreed while the (20%) are neutral and (16%) are disagreed and remaining respondents (02%) are strongly disagree to use instructional Aids in class.

Table 4
You daily prepare your lesson plan and teaching according to it

	Frequency	Percentage
Disagree	01	2.0
Agree	02	4.0
Strongly agree	47	94.0
Total	50	100.0

The analysis of the above table explains that (94%) participants were strongly agreed that they prepared lesson plan and teach according to it. (04%) were agreed while (02%) were disagreed about the above said statement.

Table 5
Brain storming is the part of your daily teaching.

	Frequency	Percentage
Strongly Disagree	10	20.0
Disagree	12	24.0
Neutral	08	16.0
Agree	18	36.0
Strongly Agree	02	04.0
Total	50	100.0

The above table explores that (36%) participants were agreed that they start their lesson from brain storming (04%) were strongly agreed. (16%) were neutral while (20%) were strongly disagreed and (24%) participants were disagreed about the statement.

Table 6 Instructional aids help to make your lesson interesting.

	1	0
	Frequency	Percentage
Strongly Disagree	01	2.0
Neutral	01	2.0
Agreed	03	6.0
Strongly Agree	45	90.0
Total	50	100.0

The table explains that (90%) of participants were strongly agreed about the statement that instructional aids help in making lesson interesting. (06%) were agreed while (02%) participants were neutral and (02%) of participants were strongly disagreed.

# **Students Data Analysis**

Table 7 Do you like your teachers teaching methods?

	3	
	Frequency	Percentage
Yes	50	43.5
No	65	56.5
Total	115	100.0

Table above shows students perception about their teachers teaching methods. (43.5%) students like their teacher's teaching methods while (56.5%) do not like the teaching methods of their teachers.

Table 8
Do you teachers use instructional aids in your class room?

	Frequency	Percentage
Yes	30	26.1
No	85	73.9
Total	115	100.0

The findings of the above table explores the analysis of question regarding the use of instructional aids in the class rooms during the lectures by their teachers. (73.9%) of the participants were not agreed and the remaining (26.1) were agreed from the above said question.

Table 9
Do your teachers ask questions related to topic before starting the lesson?

	Frequency	Percentage
Yes	40	34.8
No	75	65.2
Total	115	100.0

The concluding part of the above table shows the result of the statement about asking the questions before starting the lesson. (65.2%) of the participants were not agreed and (34.8%) of the students were agreed that their teachers ask questions before starting their lesson.

Table 10 Do you satisfy with the behavior of your teachers?

•	Frequency	Percentage
Yes	55	47.8
No	60	52.2
Total	115	100.0

The result of the above table displays of the question related to the satisfaction from the behavior of teachers. (47.8) of the students were satisfied while the remaining (52.2%) of the participants were not satisfied from the behavior of their teachers.

#### Discussion

Teaching learning process is nothing without curriculum. In 2006 the new national curriculum was make known to and applied in all the provinces of Pakistan. This new curriculum emphasizes on social problems as well as scientific education too. It has recognized standards or values, bench marks and student learning results or outcomes (Care, E 2016).

The results of current study imply that the availability of instructional methods in girls secondary schools. The findings from the analysis of responses presents that both teachers and students agreed that they have moderate instructional resources in their schools. However students disagreed with the teaching methods , lesson planning of teachers , behavior of their teachers and use of instructional aids in the classrooms. The students also disagreed with teachers motivational techniques in the classroom.

The analysis of data also show that instructional methods has positive influence on students academic performance, the teachers and students also agree that the appropriate use of instructional aids, resources and materials effects on the performance of students academics i.e (marks , CGPA). Both teachers and students agreed that appropriate use of instructional aids, materials and resources positively effect the academic performance of secondary school students. This therefore calls for the need for secondary school teachers to ensure the appropriate use of instructional materials and resources to maximize the standards of teaching-learning process in the classroom.

Class room environment can play vital role in education system. An effective communication which is top of the most important and core principle of teaching should be observable in every class room. For better and effective teaching and learning process special attention should be paid to flexible teaching methods, use of instructional aids, and arrangement of seating and availability of physical resources. Couple of years ago the classes were instructor centered and the instructor had a crucial role in classes. Such classes were not suitable for students and in this environment student have to be passive. Now by the passage of time the situation is little bit change.

In Balochistan, there are five designations for teachers which have different scales. The designations are JV, JET, muhalem ul Quran, Arabic teacher, secondary school teacher including science and general. JV teachers are specified for primary stage / section, JET and Muhalem ul Quran are specified foe middle section while secondary school teachers are specified for high or matric. Secondary School Teachers general are for general subjects like English, Urdu, Mathematics, and Islamite and Pakistan studies while Secondary School Teachers (science) are for science subjects like Physics, Chemistry and Biology.

Curriculum 2006 is implemented in all over the country. It is the plus point of this curriculum that it introduced different and new teaching methods for teaching different subjects. It is responsibility of Bureau of curriculum and Provisional institute for teacher education to provide the knowledge of applying these methods is the class rooms according to the nature of subject or topic. Till now in our schools some traditional teaching methods are still followed like lecture method and recitation method etc. There is also no use of audiovisual aids with such methods. These methods are practiced for all science subjects, social and languages. In the above said methods the most common used method is lecture method without considering that this method is useless without enquiry method and sometimes with demonstration. The teacher also provides readymade material so student's knowledge construction power is also become low. So main purpose of the teacher in this method is just give lecture, keep the class disciplined and learning and understanding of student is not the duty of teacher. (Qaiser et, 2005, pg. 44)

### Conclusion

From the study it is concluded that Instructional materials and teaching methods are very much important in determining performance of students in any educational institution. So, when the teaching methods are suitable and instructional resources are adequate, the performance will be good and vice versa. In addition, the use of improvised audio visual aids encourages and increases the efficacy of the teaching-learning process. Students who were taught using audio visual aids and new methods, performed substantially more than those who were not, and the utilization of materials and using such methodologies which actively involve the students in different activities lead to a better academic

achievement. The study also concludes that there are no adequate teachers in handling academic affairs of the students comfortably thus adequate teachers would lead to improvement in secondary schools students performance in Quetta. Based on the findings the current study therefore concludes that secondary schools in Quetta lacks spacious and equipped library.

Teaching with demonstration and inquiry are the most effective technique on improving the performance of students' academics. As motivation acts as a major factor in arousing ststudes' interest in the teaching learning process so teachers may use new and effective methods to make learning more effective. Discussion and students questioning should be encouraged so that the exchange of perspectives, experiences, and values, allowing for new learning can emerge. It was also noted that organizing students to interact with content improves students' academic performance.

Effective communication is impossible without the use of understandable and proper language. Languages are the main source of sharing ideas, communication and exchanging thoughts. In Baluchistan two languages are taught to students in all schools i-e English and Urdu. In this province many languages are spoken but Pashto, Baluchi, Brahvi and Urdu are mother languages of 90% population. Urdu (National language of Pakistan) is spoken in all schools but still most of our children are unable to understand. On the other hand the international language English is also taught and now is became a problem for students.

English language is playing the link role between west and east. For political and business status it is necessary for Pakistan to adopt this language. English is not only taught as a language but at higher or competitive examinations papers are also attempted in English. In schools grammar translation method is used for teaching English language. As English is our secondary language so that's why this method is adopted because in this method teacher has to translate sentences, phrases and even words of English into Urdu. If it isn't do then it is difficult for students to understand the lesson. At school level even words meanings are not only translated but also write them on board and students copy them and try to learn by heart. The same method is used for other languages like Arabic and Urdu too.

Very few numbers of teachers are good in speaking English so they adopt direct method for teaching English. In this method the student have to speak, write and hear in English. In such classes the use of other languages is limited. Teaching methods and use of effective instructional aids help a lot in achieving students learning outcomes. New curriculum has also defined all those terms and it also suggested innovative teaching methods for all the subjects. Such methods includes programmed instructions, simulation techniques, computer assist instructions or teaching, individualized instructions, deductive and deductive methods, question or inquiry techniques and cooperative learning. Unfortunately all these methods or techniques were not in practiced in Chiltan Town Quetta due to professionally untrained teachers. They have no knowledge about these methods.

All the teaching methods are useless when it is not planned. So there should be proper lesson planning as it is essential too. It can be called as the key of an effective teaching and learning. It also directly affects the whole learning process. The teacher must plan the whole learning process including mode of content delivery and evaluation. Through this teacher becomes able to that how to develop a concept, through which method it should deliver and how to achieve the objectives. When the teacher gets the proper idea of delivering a lesson or topic then it becomes easy for him to provide an effective learning and also get fruitful result. Mostly the teachers were agreed that they do not prepare lesson plan before delivering lecture and there was also no check and balance on it in most of the schools.

The responses of science teachers about their methods and experiments were that they explain their topic with the help of science equipment. Their students also perform their practical in laboratory under their guidance. Some of the teachers also go for feedback from their students.

#### Recommendations

Based on the findings of this study the following recommendations are suggested.

- 1. Education department should introduce new and effective teaching methods in curriculum for all the subjects.
- 2. There should be specific budget for the training and refresher courses of teachers regarding teaching methodologies.
- 3. Government of Balochistan should also increase educational budget and its fair distribution regarding instructional resources.
- 4. There should be proper check and balance on feeding schools regarding providing materials to cluster schools.
- 5. Bureau of curriculum and Provincial institute for teachers' education should increase trainings and should provide these trainings to all the cadres.
- 6. Government should provide all science materials/ equipment. Some schools have laboratories but no equipment.
- 7. A proper training regarding the use of science equipment should be provided to science teachers.
- 8. In schools the use of multimedia should be encouraged and try to provide multimedia in all schools.
- 9. There should be proper check and balance from higher authorities on schools as well in schools administration should play effective role regarding effective learning process.
- 10. Teachers should also cooperate with each other's and should share their teaching methods with other teachers.
- 11. Now for better learning, secondary education department should introduce constructivism approach and for this purpose now activities should be included in curriculum.
- 12. It should be teacher's responsibility to make his/her lesson easy by examples and by correlating the topic with other subjects.
- 13. Teacher should adopt new teaching methods for the better understanding of students.
- 14. Instructional resources should be used in the classrooms. Teachers should explain the topic with the help of instructional aids.
- 15. Teaching methods should be flexible and according to student's level.
- 16. For future research it is also recommended that future research studies must be conducted on the impacts of teaching methods in primary schools of the district Ouetta.
- 17. For the improvement of education it is also recommend that based on the findings of this study, the Education department policy and planning unit must conduct research studies in other parts of the province too.

#### References

- Adunola, O. (2011). The Impact of Teachers' Teaching Methods on the Academic Performance of Primary School Pupils in Ijebu-Ode Local cut Area of Ogun State, Ego Booster Books, Ogun State, Nigeria
- Akram, M., & Zepeda, S. J. (2015). Development and Validation of a Teacher Self-assessment Instrument. *Journal of Research & Reflections in Education (JRRE)*, 9(2).
- Ayeni, A.J. (2011). Teachers' professional development and quality assurance in Nigerian Secondary Schools. *World Journal of Education*, 1(1), 143-149.
- Basileo, L.D, & Toth M.(2019). A State Level Analysis of the Marzano Teacher Evaluation Model: Predicting Teacher Value-Added Measures with Observation Scores. *Practical Assessment, Research, and Evaluation*, 24(1),6.
- Bharadwaj,B.k, & pal, S. (2012). Mining educational data to analyze students' performance. arXiv preparing arXiv: 1201.3417.
- Care, E., & Luo, R. (2016). Assessment of Transversal Competences. *Policy and Practice in Asia- Pacific Region. Bangkok*, UNESCO Bangkok.
- Chang, W., Jones, A., & Kunnemeyer, R. (2002, June). Interactive Teaching Approach in Year One University Physics in Taiwan: Implementation and evaluation. *Asia Pacific Form on Science learning and teaching* 3(1), 1-23).
- Creswell, J. W., & Creswell, J. D. (1994). Research design.
- Glewwe, P., A Holla and Kremer, M. (2008). Teacher Incentives in the Developing World. *Performance incentives: Their growing impact on American K-12 education*, 295-326
- Meleisea, E. (2005). Educating for Creativity: Bringing the Arts and Culture into Asian Education. Report of the Asian Regional symposia on Arts in Education (Hong Kong SAR, China, January 9-11,2004) and transmissions and transformations: Learning through the Arts in Asia (New Delhi, India, March 21-24,2005). UNESCO Bangkok.
- Rehman, A., & Haider, K. (2013). The impact of Motivation on learning of secondary school students in Karachi: An analytical study. *Educational Research International*, 2(2), 139-147.
- Umer, S., & Siddiqui, J. A. (2013). Improving trends of teaching methods used in concept schools of Karachi: An Evaluative study. *Educational Research international*, 2(2), 146-154.
- Wong, P.L. (1995). Constructing a public popular education in Sao Paulo, Barazil. *Comparative Education Review*, 39(1), 120-141.
- Zeeb, H., Biwer, F., Brunner, G., Leuders, T., & Renkl, A.(2019). Make It Relevant! How Prior Instructions Foster the Integration of Teacher Knowledge. *Instructional Science*, 47(6), 711-739